

Public Records Request #3825

The following materials have been gathered in response to public records request #3825. These materials include:

- Civil Service Board Minutes – January 8, 2019
- Civil Service Board Minutes – February 5, 2019
- Civil Service Board Minutes – March 5, 2019
- Civil Service Board Minutes – April 2, 2019
- Civil Service Board Minutes – April 16, 2019
- Civil Service Board Minutes – May 7, 2019
- Civil Service Board Minutes – June 4, 2019
- Civil Service Board Minutes – July 2, 2019
- Civil Service Board Minutes – August 6, 2019
- Civil Service Board Minutes – September 3, 2019
- Civil Service Board Minutes – October 1, 2019
- Civil Service Board Minutes – November 5, 2019
- Civil Service Board Minutes – December 3, 2019
- Civil Service Board Minutes – January 7, 2020
- Civil Service Board Minutes – February 4, 2020
- Civil Service Board Minutes – March 3, 2020
- Civil Service Board Minutes – April 7, 2020
- Civil Service Board Minutes – May 5, 2020
- Civil Service Board Minutes – June 2, 2020
- Civil Service Board Minutes – June 5, 2020
- Civil Service Board Minutes – July 7, 2020
- Civil Service Board Minutes – August 4, 2020
- Civil Service Board Minutes – September 1, 2020
- Civil Service Board Minutes – October 6, 2020
- Civil Service Board Minutes – November 4, 2020
- Civil Service Board Minutes – December 1, 2020
- Civil Service Board Minutes – January 5, 2021
- Civil Service Board Minutes – February 2, 2021
- Civil Service Board Minutes – March 2, 2021
- Civil Service Board Minutes – April 6, 2021
- Civil Service Board Minutes – May 4, 2021
- Civil Service Board Minutes – June 1, 2021
- Notice of Final Decision of the City of Charlotte Civil Service Board Regarding Dismissal of Officer as Disciplinary Action

This information was provided as a response to a public records request on 8/27/21 and is current to that date. There is a possibility of more current information and/or documents related to the stated subject matter.

Further Information

For further information about this request or the Citywide Records Program, please contact:

Cheyenne Flotree
Citywide Records Program Manager
City of Charlotte/City Clerk's Office
600 East 4th Street, 7th Floor
Charlotte, NC 28202
Cheyenne.Flotree@charlottenc.gov

Amelia Knight
Public Records Specialist
City of Charlotte/City Clerk's Office
600 East 4th Street, 7th Floor
Charlotte, NC 28202
Amelia.Knight@charlottenc.gov

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, January 8, 2019 at 4:00 p.m. in Conference Room #786 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Chairman Ryan McGill, presiding. Board members present were Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, David McCleary, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Vice Chair Victoria Watlington and Douglas Young.

ABSENT: N/A

ALSO PRESENT: Catherine Cooper, Senior Assistant City Attorney; Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board; and Lauren Livingston, Assistant Clerk to the Board.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chairman Ryan McGill asked that the agenda be approved for the January 8, 2019 meeting.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda as submitted.
--

CFD FIRE CHIEF REGINALD JOHNSON AND CFD HR ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER KRISTI KJELDSSEN ENTERED AT 4:03 PM.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS:

Board Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for promotion to Firefighter Engineer.

Promotion for Firefighter Engineer:

Brandon Hart	Reginald Blackmon	Charles Walker
--------------	-------------------	----------------

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. He asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Ms. Hatch, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to Firefighter Engineer.
--

Board Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for promotion to Fire Captain.

Promotion to Fire Captain:

Travis Matthews	Shawn Sandau	David Ezekiel
Bryan Shuford	Tremayne Battle	

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. He asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to Fire Captain.

Board Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for promotion to Battalion Chief.

Promotion to Battalion Chief:

Timothy Brown	Kevin Rink	
---------------	------------	--

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. He asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to Battalion Chief.

Promotion to Deputy Chief:

Jerry Winkles		
---------------	--	--

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. He asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to Battalion Chief.

CONSIDER CFD NEW HIRES:

Board Chair Ryan McGill read the names of the candidates for hire.

Recruit Class 109:

Donald Andrews II	Thomas Hayes	Adam Jenkins
Michael Pearson	Michael Powell	Travis Puckett
Vincent Sacoto	Ryan Shrum	Adam Smith
Jordan Steward	Steven Sweatt	David Tindell

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. The chairman asked for a motion to approve the applicants for hire.

Motion was made by Ms. Watlington, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for hire.

Chair McGill stated the Board desires to visit the Fire Academy to gain greater insight on the hiring process for the CFD.

Ms. Kjeldsen stated that out of the 21 new hires in Recruit Class 109, seven were minorities.

CFD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:11 P.M.

REPRESENTATIVES MAJOR LISA GOELZ, CAPTAIN DAVE JOHNSON AND LIEUTENANT KEITH CAVINESS ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:11 P.M.

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES:

Board member Mr. McCleary read the names of the candidates for hire.

Recruit Applicants for Hire:

David Waldron Andrew	Jacques Aleksandr Caravaca	Caleb Stevan Corrales
Elizabeth Ann Gollither	Charles Edward Jackson Jr.	Alec Uriah Mullis
Raul Robert Muniz	Andrew Todd Nichols	Samuel Eric Parker

Mr. McCleary asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. Three candidates, Mullis, Nichols and Caravaca were pulled.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:13 P.M.

CMPD representatives remained in the room during the closed session.

Motion was made by Ms. Watlington, seconded by Mr. Young and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of prospective police officers.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:26 P.M.

Motion was made by Ms. Watlington, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to return to open session.

Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the candidates for hire.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Ms. Watlington, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for hire.

Chair McGill stated Chief Putney will be presenting the end of the year crime statistics and the state of community safety at a briefing on Friday, January 11th at 10:00 a.m., at the Renaissance West Community Center located at 3610 Nobles Avenue. Chair McGill also stated the Board would plan a visit to the Police Academy to observe the hiring process.

CMPD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:31 P.M.

OTHER BUSINESS:

Ms. Kelly stated there would be a CMPD presentation at the February CSB Board Meeting. Ms. Kelly reminded Board members to submit their statements of economic interest by February 1st, 2019 and to submit a survey regarding board engagement to the City Manager's Office by January 9th, 2019. The City Clerk's Office is working to schedule three upcoming Civil Service Board hearings for February and March.

There being no further business for discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 4:36 p.m. upon a motion by Mr. Baldwin and a second by Ms. Millen.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

Length of meeting: 36 minutes

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, February 5, 2019 at 4:00 p.m. in Conference Room #701 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Chairman Ryan McGill, presiding. Board members present were Kyle Clements, David McCleary, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Vice Chair Victoria Watlington and Douglas Young.

ABSENT UNTIL NOTED: Charlitta Hatch

ABSENT: Tom Baldwin

ALSO PRESENT: Catherine Cooper, Senior Assistant City Attorney; Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board; and Lauren Livingston, Assistant Clerk to the Board.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chair Ryan McGill asked that the agenda be approved for the February 5, 2019 Civil Service Board Meeting with the exception of approving the December 2018 and the February 2019 meeting minutes.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Ms. Reynolds, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda as amended.

CFD FIRE CHIEF REGINALD JOHNSON, CFD HR ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER KRISTI KJELDEN, CFD DEPUTY CHIEF OF PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION JERRY WINKLES, AND CFD HR SPECIALIST TAMARA AGUILAR ENTERED AT 4:02 P.M.

BOARD MEMBER CHARLITTA HATCH ARRIVED AT 4:03 P.M.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS:

Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for promotion to Firefighter Engineer.

Promotion for Firefighter Engineer:

Jeffrey Nixon	Michael Feneis	Fred Curtis
---------------	----------------	-------------

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to Firefighter Engineer.

Chair McGill read the name of the candidate for promotion to Battalion Chief.

Promotion for Battalion Chief:

Brian Beatty		
--------------	--	--

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. One candidate, Brian Beatty, was pulled for discussion.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD WENT INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:07 P.M.

CFD representatives remained in the room during closed session.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Ms. Millen and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective fire promotion.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:09 P.M.

Motion was made by Ms. Watlington, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to return to open session.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to Battalion Chief.

CFD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:14 P.M.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES POLICE CHIEF KERR PUTNEY, DEPUTY CITY ATTORNEY MARK NEWBOLD, DEPUTY POLICE CHIEF JOHNNY JENNINGS, ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES MANAGER KAMELLA EMMANUEL, JAY JONES ASSISTANT HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGER, MAJOR LISA GOELZ, CAPTAIN DAVE JOHNSON, LIEUTENANT KEITH CAVINESS, AND SERGEANT STEVE MILLER ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:14 P.M.

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES:

Board Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for hire from Recruit Class 182.

Recruit Applicants for Hire:

Jackson Blackmore Buffington	Joshua Paul Chase	Jonathan Thomas Chester
Kevin Joseph Daly	Joshua Robert Garrett	Spencer David Garrett
Austin Mitchell Mace	Joseph Anthony Maresco	Micah Shaw Newman
Megan Marie Pirkel	Jacob Benjamin Prendergast	Luis Xavier Rivera
Kyla May Robson	Gerald Garrett Russell	Bryson Terrell Seger
Matthew Taylor Tucker	Andrew Ralph Ward	Derek Thomas Weber
Lucineia Mesquita Wiseman		

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. Six candidates, Buffington, Chester, Joshua Robert Garrett, Mace, Newman, and Russell were pulled.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:17 P.M.

CMPD representatives remained in the room during the closed session.

Motion was made by Ms. Watlington, seconded by Mr. McCleary and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence and fitness of prospective police officers.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:54 P.M.

Motion was made by Ms. Watlington, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to return to open session.

Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the candidates for hire for Recruit Class 182.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen to approve the candidates for hire apart from Mr. Joshua Robert Garrett. Ms. Millen withdrew the motion.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried by a seven to one vote to deny approval for hire of Joshua Robert Garrett and to suggest applicant re-apply in a year's time.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to recommend applicant Joshua Robert Garrett re-apply in the future.

Chair McGill requested the demographics for the Recruit Class 182. Captain Johnson stated, out of the class of 19, the demographics were 63 percent white male and 37 percent female and/or minority and out of the class of 30, the demographics were 60 percent white male and 40 percent female and/or minority.

MAJOR LISA GOELZ, CAPTAIN DAVE JOHNSON, AND LIEUTENANT KEITH CAVINESS LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:59 P.M.

Ms. Emmanuel presented the CMPD promotional process to the Civil Service Board where she explained the promotional policy, list of ranks in the promotional process, eligibility requirements for promotions, the promotional process procedure.

Attorney Newbold presented various sources for police standards and practice where he explained police response to resistance from a historical perspective, from a constitutional standard, and from a North Carolina State standard.

CMPD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 5:35 P.M.

OTHER BUSINESS:

Ms. Kelly stated there would be a CMPD presentation by Estella Patterson at the April CSB Board Meeting. There are three Civil Service Board hearings scheduled for February 26, 2019, March 19, 2019, and March 29, 2019.

Chair McGill stated the Board is interested in doing ride-a-longs with CMPD police officers and is interested in witnessing a CPMD mock hiring process.

There being no further business for discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 5:40 p.m. upon a motion by Ms. Watlington and a second by Ms. Millen.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

Length of meeting: 1 hour and 40 minutes

March 5, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 268
Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, March 5, 2019 at 4:00 p.m. in Conference Room #701 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Vice Chair Victoria Watlington, presiding. Board members present were Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, Carolyn Millen, and Chris Reynolds.

ABSENT: Chair Ryan McGill, David McCleary, and Douglas Young.

ALSO PRESENT: Catherine Cooper, Senior Assistant City Attorney and Lauren Livingston, Assistant Clerk to the Board.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Vice Chair Victoria Watlington asked that the CFD Academy date be added to the agenda.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to amend the agenda.

Vice Chair Watlington asked that the amended agenda be approved for the March 5, 2019 Civil Service Board Meeting.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Ms. Hatch, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda as amended.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Vice Chair Victoria Watlington asked for the regular session and closed session Civil Service Board Minutes from December 4, 2018 be approved.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the meeting minutes.

Vice Chair Victoria Watlington asked for the regular session and closed session Civil Service Board Minutes from January 8, 2018 be approved.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the meeting minutes.

Vice Chair Victoria Watlington asked for the regular session and closed session Civil Service Board Minutes from February 5, 2018 be approved.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Ms. Hatch, and carried unanimously to approve the meeting minutes.

Upon review, Kyle Clements asked for the December 4th, 2018 minutes to be amended to reflect correct attendance. Mr. Clements was marked absent for the December 4th, 2018 meeting, but had not yet taken his Oath of Office.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Ms. Hatch, and carried unanimously to approve the meeting minutes as amended.

CFD HR ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER KRISTI KJELDTSEN AND CFD DEPUTY CHIEF OF PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION JERRY WINKLES ENTERED AT 4:07 P.M.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS:

Ms. Millen read the names of the candidates for promotion to Firefighter Engineer.

Promotion for Firefighter Engineer:

Douglas McCormac	Ryan Wilson	
------------------	-------------	--

Vice Chair Watlington asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. Vice Chair Watlington asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Ms. Hatch, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to Firefighter Engineer.

Ms. Millen read the names of the candidates for promotion to Fire Captain.

Promotion for Fire Captain:

Nathan Jones	David Combs	
--------------	-------------	--

March 5, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 270
Civil Service Board

Vice Chair Watlington asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. Vice Chair Watlington asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to Fire Captain.

CFD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:11 P.M.

OTHER BUSINESS:

Ms. Livingston stated that there is CMPD Police Academy Day scheduled for April 16, 2019 from 8:00 a.m. until 4:00 p.m.

Ms. Watlington sought the Board's input on a date to visit the CFD Academy. It was decided that the Board would visit the Academy to view applicants taking the Candidate Physical Ability Test on either April 16th or May 16th starting at 8:30 a.m.

Ms. Livingston stated there was an upcoming hearing on Tuesday, March 19th, 2019. Ms. Livingston asked that Board members complete their May and June availability as there are four Civil Service Board Hearings to be scheduled.

There being no further business for discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 4:18 p.m. upon a motion by Mr. Baldwin and a second by Ms. Millen.



Lauren Livingston, Asst. Clerk to the Board

April 2, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 271
Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, April 2, 2019 at 4:02 p.m. in Conference Room #701 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Chair Ryan McGill, presiding. Board members present were Tom Baldwin, Charlitta Hatch, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Vice Chair Victoria Watlington and Douglas Young.

ABSENT UNTIL NOTED: David McCleary

ABSENT: Kyle Clements

ALSO PRESENT: Catherine Cooper, Senior Assistant City Attorney and Lauren Livingston, Assistant Clerk to the Board.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chair Ryan McGill asked that the agenda be approved for the April 2, 2019 Civil Service Board Meeting apart from approving the February 26, 2019 and March 19, 2019 hearing minutes.

Motion was made by Ms. Watlington, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda as amended.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Chair Ryan McGill asked that the minutes from the Civil Service Board Meeting on March 5, 2019 be approved.

Motion was made by Ms. Hatch, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes from the March 5, 2019 Civil Service Board Meeting.

CFD HR ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER KRISTI KJELDEN, CFD DEPUTY CHIEF OF PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION JERRY WINKLES, AND CFD HR SPECIALIST TAMARA AGUILAR ENTERED AT 4:04 P.M.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS:

Ms. Hatch read the names of the candidates for promotion to Firefighter II.

Promotion for Firefighter II:

Matthew Beteta	Winston Haney	Jeems Pearson
Tawni Chambers	William Holmes, II	Matthew Rollins
Joshua Dellinger	Andrew Laskey	Drew Rucks
Colton Edwards	Geoffrey Mashburn	Patrick Saunders
Malachi Ford	Antonio Miller	James Sinopoli
Jojo Hall	Carlos Moore, Jr.	George Teodorescu
Jacob Hanes	Bradley Overcash	

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to Firefighter II.
--

Chair McGill read the name of the candidates for promotion to Firefighter Engineer.

Promotion for Firefighter Engineer:

James Isenhour	Eric Hoyte	Michael Evans
----------------	------------	---------------

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Ms. Watlington, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to Firefighter Engineer.

Chair McGill read the name of the candidate for promotion to Fire Captain.

Promotion for Fire Captain:

Timothy Ashe		
--------------	--	--

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to Fire Captain.
--

CFD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:09 P.M.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES CAPTAIN DAVE JOHNSON, LIEUTENANT KEITH CAVINESS, SERGEANT STEVE MILLER, AND CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES TRAINING REPRESENTATIVE CARA TERRANCE ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:10 P.M.

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES:

Board Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for hire from Recruit Class 183.

Recruit Applicants for Hire:

Harley Bruce Bentley III	Steven Mark Moore	Irma Denise Settle
Anna Cristina Caldwell	Benny Phung	Derick Braxton Shuler
Justin Edward Griesinger	Heath Wayne Rogers	Adrian Scott Taylor
Thomas Marion Mattox IV		

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No candidates were pulled. Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for hire.

Motion was made by Ms. Hatch, seconded by Ms. Watlington, and carried unanimously to approve CMPD candidates for hire.
--

Chair McGill requested the demographics for the Recruit Class 183. Captain Johnson stated there were six white males, one African American male, one African American woman, one Asian male, and one Asian female.

CAPTAIN DAVE JOHNSON, LIEUTENANT KEITH CAVINESS, SERGEANT STEVE MILLER, AND CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES TRAINING REPRESENTATIVE CARA TERRANCE LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:14 P.M.

DAVID MCCLEARY ENTERED AT 4:15 P.M.

CMPD ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES MANAGER KAMELA EMMANUEL ENTERED AT 4:15 P.M.

Ms. Hatch read the names of the candidates for promotion to the Rank of Deputy Chief.

Promotion for the Rank of Deputy Chief:

Police Major Estella Patterson	Police Major Gerald Smith	
--------------------------------	---------------------------	--

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Ms. Watlington, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to the Rank of Deputy Chief.

Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for promotion to the Rank of Major.

Promotion for the Rank of Major:

Police Captain Cecil Brisbon	Police Captain David Robinson	
------------------------------	-------------------------------	--

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to the Rank of Major.

Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for promotion to the Rank of Captain.

Promotion for the Rank of Captain:

Police Lieutenant Julie Barry	Police Lieutenant Joel McNelly	
-------------------------------	--------------------------------	--

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to the Rank of Captain.

Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for promotion to the Rank of Lieutenant.

Promotion for the Rank of Lieutenant:

Police Sergeant Joan Gallant	Police Sergeant Stephen Iyevbele	Police Sergeant Gilberto Narvaez
------------------------------	----------------------------------	----------------------------------

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to the Rank of Lieutenant.
--

Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for promotion to the Rank of Sergeant.

Promotion for the Rank of Sergeant:

Police Officer Camilla Benloss	Police Officer Jeremiah Johnson	Police Officer Christopher Walters
Police Officer Joshua Gibbons	Police Officer Jose Torres	Police Officer Gerren Willis
Police Officer Miguel Jaco Vargas		

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to the Rank of Sergeant.
--

CMPD ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES MANAGER KAMELA EMMANUEL LEFT AT 4:18 P.M.

CMPD DEPUTY CHIEF ESTELLA PATTERSON AND MAJOR CECIL BRISBON ENTERED AT 4:20 P.M.

Deputy Chief Estella Patterson provided a presentation on the CMPD Internal Affairs Bureau to the Civil Service Board. Deputy Chief Patterson explained that the role of Internal Affairs is to conduct thorough and impartial investigations of alleged employee misconduct, provide proactive measures to prevent misconduct, to identify potential problem behavior at its earliest stages, and to monitor trends in behavior and make recommendations for training and policy changes. The annual Internal Affairs report can be viewed at the CMPD website at www.CMPD.org.

April 2, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 275
Civil Service Board

CMPD DEPUTY CHIEF ESTELLA PATTERSON AND MAJOR CECIL BRISBON LEFT AT 4:50 P.M.

OTHER BUSINESS:

Ms. Livingston stated there would be a Civil Service Board hearing on Wednesday, June 26, 2019 and Thursday, June 27, 2019 for a citation for termination at the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center in room 280. Chair Ryan McGill, Charlitta Hatch, Chris Reynolds, David McCleary, and Tom Baldwin will serve on the hearing panel.

The Civil Service Board will visit the CFD and CMPD academies on Tuesday, April 16, 2019 from 8:30 A.M. until 4 P.M.

There being no further business for discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 5:00 p.m. upon a motion by Ms. Millen and a second by Mr. Young.



Lauren Livingston, Assistant Clerk to the Board

Length of meeting: 58 minutes

May 7, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 276
Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, May 7, 2019 at 4:00 p.m. in Conference Room #701 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Chair Ryan McGill, presiding. Board members present were Kyle Clements, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, and Vice Chair Victoria Watlington.

ABSENT: Tom Baldwin, Charlitta Hatch, and Douglas Young

ALSO PRESENT: Catherine Cooper, Senior Assistant City Attorney, Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board, and Lauren Livingston, Assistant Clerk to the Board

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chair McGill asked that the approval of two Closed Session Civil Service Board hearing minutes be added to the May 7, 2019 agenda.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to add the approval of two Closed Session Civil Service Board hearing minutes to the agenda.

Chair McGill asked the agenda be approved for the May 7, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting as amended.

Motion was made by Vice Chair Watlington, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda as amended.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Chair McGill asked that the minutes from the Civil Service Board meeting on April 2, 2019 be approved.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes from the April 2, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES CAPTAIN DAVE JOHNSON, LIEUTENANT KEITH CAVINESS, MAJOR LISA GOELZ, AND CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES TRAINING REPRESENTATIVE CARA TERRANCE ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:02 P.M.

CONSIDER CMPD RECRUIT APPLICANTS FOR HIRE:

Chair McGill read the names of the CMPD recruit applicants for hire.

Recruit Applicants for Hire:

Robert Paul Ahlers	Michael Carl Best	Gregory Joseph Beucler
Joseph Matthew Chaneski	Boris Adrian Custode	Bradford Carrier Guillet
Rachel Lynn Hanek	Iraldiba Alessandra Herrera	William Linzy House

Zavon Alexander Joseph	Tayler Banks Kell	Yong Min Kim
Timothy Justin O'Lear	Zachary Tyler Peppelman	Justin Elliott Price
Timothy Gage Reece	Eric Michael Seiden	Raphael Cruz Torres
Destiny Emiya Wylie		

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. Bradford Carrier Guillet and Timothy Justin O'Lear were pulled.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD WENT INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:04 P.M.

CMPD representatives remained in the room during closed session.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CMPD hires.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:11 P.M.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to return to open session.

Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for hire.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

Mr. Clements asked how CMPD planned to recruit for the Republican National Convention. Major Goelz stated that CMPD was selective in choosing officers from outside agencies and that CMPD has parameters it reviews.

Regarding regular applications submitted to CMPD, Lieutenant Caviness stated CMPD has received approximately the same amount of applications as the previous year, and CMPD is looking at marketing outlets such as Google Boost and Spotify Radio to further push CMPD visibility. Major Goelz stated CMPD is looking at incentive programs to encourage recruitment.

Captain Johnson stated the demographics for the applicants approved for hire from Recruit Class 183 were 11 white males, two black males, two Hispanic males, one Asian male, one white female, one black female, and one Hispanic female.

CMPD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:14 P.M.

CFD FIRE CHIEF REGINALD JOHNSON, CFD DEPUTY CHIEF OF PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION JERRY WINKLES, AND CFD HR SPECIALIST TAMARA AGUILAR ENTERED AT 4:23 P.M.

Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for promotion to Firefighter Engineer.

Promotion for Firefighter Engineer:

Jeffrey Field	Ronald Smith Jr.	Willie E. Tucker
---------------	------------------	------------------

Chair McGill asked if any applicants should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to Firefighter Engineer.

Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for promotion to Fire Captain.

Promotion for Fire Captain:

Matthew Clark	Robert Moore Jr.	Lucas Marks (Pending DC Promo)
Michael Seymour (Pending DC Promo)		

Chair McGill asked if any applicants should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled. Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Vice Chair Watlington, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion to Fire Captain.
--

CFD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:31 P.M.

APPROVAL OF CLOSED SESSION HEARING MINUTES FROM FEBRUARY 26, 2019:

Chair McGill asked for Board members present for the February 26, 2019 hearing to remain in the meeting room.

Chair McGill, Vice Chair Watlington, and Mr. McCleary left the room at 4:32 P.M.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD WENT INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:32 P.M.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider approval of the February 26, 2019 CSB hearing minutes.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:33 P.M.

Chair McGill, Vice Chair Watlington, and Mr. McCleary entered the room at 4:33 P.M.

APPROVAL OF CLOSED SESSIOM HEARING MINUTES FROM MARCH 19, 2019:

Chair McGill asked for Board members present for the March 19, 2019 hearing to remain in the meeting room.

Mr. Clements, Ms. Hatch, Ms. Millen, Ms. Reynolds and Mr. McCleary left the room at 4:40 P.M.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD WENT INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:40 P.M.

Motion was made by Vice Chair Watlington, seconded by Chair McGill, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider approval of the March 19, 2019 CSB hearing minutes.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:48 P.M.

Mr. Clements, Ms. Hatch, Ms. Millen, Ms. Reynolds and Mr. McCleary entered the room at 4:48 P.M.

OTHER BUSINESS:

Ms. Livingston stated that the Civil Service Board has two upcoming hearings. A termination hearing scheduled for June 5, 2019 and a termination hearing scheduled for June 26, 2109 and June 27, 2019. She asked Civil Service Board members to please confirm their availability.

Ms. Reynolds questioned the requirements for CMPD's de-escalation training. She asked for the deadline required for all CMPD officers to complete the de-escalation training.

There being no further business for discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 4:49 p.m. upon a motion by Ms. Millen and a second by Vice Chair Watlington.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

Length of meeting: 49 minutes

June 4, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 280
Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, June 4, 2019 at 4:00 p.m. in Conference Room #701 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Chair Ryan McGill, presiding. Board members present were Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Vice Chair Victoria Watlington, and Douglas Young.

ABSENT: Charlitta Hatch and David McCleary

ALSO PRESENT: Catherine Cooper, Senior Assistant City Attorney, Clarence Matherson, City Attorney, and Lauren Livingston, Assistant Clerk to the Board

Board Attorney Catherine Cooper introduced City Attorney Clarence Matherson who will represent the Charlotte Fire Department in upcoming Civil Service Board hearings.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chair McGill asked that the agenda be approved for the June 4, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.
--

APPROVE MINUTES:

Chair McGill asked that the minutes from the Civil Service Board meeting on May 7, 2019 be approved.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Vice Chair Watlington, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes from the May 7, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting.
--

CFD REPRESENTATIVES CHIEF REGINALD JOHNSON, DEPUTY CHIEF JERRY WINKLES, AND HUMAN RESOURCES REPRESENTATIVE TAMARA AGUILAR ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:02 P.M.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS:

Chair McGill read the names of the CFD candidates for promotion to Division Fire Chief.

Promotion to Division Fire Chief:

Peter Skeris		
--------------	--	--

Chair McGill asked if the application should be pulled for discussion in closed session. The application was not pulled

Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the candidate for promotion.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded Vice Chair Watlington, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate for promotion to Division Fire Chief.

Chief Johnson stated that CFD will provide a presentation to the Civil Service Board on its third-party vendor at the next CSB meeting.

CFD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:07 P.M.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES CAPTAIN DAVE JOHNSON, LIEUTENANT KEITH CAVINESS, AND CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES TRAINING REPRESENTATIVE CARA TERRANCE ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:08 P.M.

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES:

Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for hire from Recruit Class 183.

Jonathan Marshall Adams	Joseph Dealton Irvine	Klut Rahlan
Helen Jasmin Aragon	Madison Nicole Jones	Jessica Leigh Ross
Francis Albert Miranda Auayang	Morgan Brianna King	William Dale Smith
Zachary James Azarian	Matthew-Ryan James Lerlo	Tyler Phillip Spiegler
Philip Ian Bracco	Lucas D'Andrea Sterling	Edward Francis Wickline
Brandy Jean Casperson	Nerick Moise Lufungula	Douglass Alexander Williams
Alyssa DePierro	Joe Sebastian Morales	Jonathan Gabriel Williams
Lauren Rose Ehlke	Cody Elisha Mullns	
Phillip Hernandez Jr.	Andrew William Murtha	

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. Helen Jasmin Aragon, Phillip Hernandez Jr., Joseph Dealton Irvine, and Doug Williams were pulled.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD WENT INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:11 P.M.

CMPD representatives remained in the room during closed session.

Motion was made by Vice Chair Watlington, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CMPD hires.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:26 P.M.

Motion was made by Vice Chair Watlington, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to return to open session.

Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for hire.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

Captain Johnson stated the demographics for the applicants approved for hire for Recruit Class 183 were 11 white males, four black males, two Hispanic males, two Asian males, six white females, and one Hispanic female.

CMPD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:28 P.M.

CMPD ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES MANAGER KAMELA EMMANUEL AND CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES SUPERVISOR ROBERT LUCAS ENTERED AT 4:28 P.M.

Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for promotion to the Rank of Captain, Lieutenant, and Sergeant. Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applicants were pulled.

Promotion for the Rank of Captain:

Police Lieutenant Bradford Koch	Police Lieutenant Brian Sanders	
---------------------------------	---------------------------------	--

Promotion for the Rank of Lieutenant:

Police Sergeant James Ivie	Police Sergeant Amy Stukey	
----------------------------	----------------------------	--

Promotion for the Rank of Sergeant:

Police Officer Jennifer Barba	Police Officer Jason Bossert	Police Officer Candace Foggie
Police Officer David Padgett		

Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for promotion.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the candidates recommended for promotion.

June 4, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 283
Civil Service Board

OTHER BUSINESS:

Ms. Livingston stated the Civil Service Board hearing scheduled for June 5, 2019 was canceled due to the resignation of the officer. A termination hearing is still scheduled for June 26, 2109 and June 27, 2019.

Board Attorney Catherine Cooper discussed a letter received by CMPD Chief Kerr Putney requesting input on CMPD's potential revisions of the directive concerning when and how much force may be applied by officers when responding to resistant subjects. The Board drafted a response to Chief Putney's request for feedback.

The Board decided to keep the date for July's CSB meeting as Tuesday, July 2, 2019.

There being no further business for discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 4:48 p.m. upon a motion by Mr. Clements and a second by Mr. Baldwin.



Lauren Livingston, Assistant Clerk to the Board

Length of meeting: 48 minutes

July 2, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 284
Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, July 2, 2019 at 4:00 p.m. in Conference Room #701 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members present were Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, and Douglas Young.

ABSENT UNTIL NOTED: David McCleary and Vice Chair Victoria Watlington

ALSO, PRESENT: Catherine Cooper, Senior Assistant City Attorney, Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board, Lauren Livingston, Assistant Clerk to the Board

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chair McGill asked that the agenda be approved for the July 2, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Chair McGill asked that the minutes from the Civil Service Board meeting on June 4, 2019 be approved.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes from the June 4, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES SERGEANT DAVID MILLER, MAJOR LISA GOELZ, AND CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES TRAINING REPRESENTATIVE CARA TERRANCE ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:01 P.M.

Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for hire for CMPD Recruit Class 184.

Travell Devon Bice	Samuel Rhea Blobe	Shanelle Crystal Little
Willice John Littlefield	ShRhonda Lashae Ross	Nicholas Ryan Wall

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. Nicholas Ryan Wall was pulled.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD WENT INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:03 P.M.

CMPD representatives remained in the room during closed session.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CMPD hires.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:05 P.M.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to return to open session.

VICE CHAIR VICTORIA WATLINGTON ENTERED AT 4:05 P.M.

Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for hire.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

Sergeant David Miller stated the demographics for the applicants approved for hire for Recruit Class 184 were three white males, two African American females, and one African American male.

Ms. Hatch requested an overview of CMPD's overall recruitment plan for the upcoming Republican National Convention. Sergeant Miller stated CMPD will continue its normal recruitment with more than 50 candidates in the upcoming September class. Major Goelz stated that CMPD will contract hundreds of officers from other police agencies for the convention.

DAVID MCCLEARY ENTERED AT 4:08 P.M.

CMPD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:10 P.M.

CFD REPRESENTATIVES DEPUTY CHIEF JERRY WINKLES AND HUMAN RESOURCES REPRESENTATIVE TAMARA AGUILAR ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:11 P.M.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS:

Chair McGill read the names of the CFD candidates for promotion.

Promotion to Firefighter Engineer:

Neil Bollinger	Richard Bellina	
----------------	-----------------	--

Promotion to Fire Captain:

Terri Garland	Michael Morley	
---------------	----------------	--

Promotion to Battalion Fire Chief:

Jason Perdue	Charles Vanhoy	
--------------	----------------	--

Promotion to Division Fire Chief:

Justin Field		
--------------	--	--

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applications were pulled.

Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the candidates for promotion.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates for promotion.

Deputy Chief Winkles stated the demographics for the promotions were six white males and one white female.

Ms. Hatch requested an overview of CFD's overall recruitment plan for the upcoming Republican National Convention. Deputy Chief Winkles stated CFD had no plans for increased or outside recruiting specifically for the RNC.

CFD PRESENTATION: OVERVIEW OF MORRIS AND MCDANIEL'S PROCESS

Deputy Chief Winkles provided an overview of the Morris and McDaniel, an outside vendor, used by CFD for its promotional process. He explained that Morris and McDaniel, Inc. is experienced in personnel selection, organizational development, human-resource consulting, and personnel placement.

On March 21, 2019, the project team of Morris and McDaniel discussed a project proposal with CFD officials to conduct a job analysis for the tested CFD ranks, to recommend assessment process for the tested ranks, and to develop testing and training for the tested ranks.

A proposed three-year contract, with a five-year option, with Morris and McDaniel's will go before City Council for approval.

CFD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:27 P.M.

OTHER BUSINESS:

Ms. Livingston stated Civil Service Board hearings are scheduled for August 14, 2019 for a CFD suspension and for August 20 & 21, 2019 for a CMPD citation for termination.

There being no further business for discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 4:27 p.m. upon a motion by Mr. McCleary and a second by Mr. Baldwin.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

Length of meeting: 27 minutes

August 6, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 287
Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, August 6, 2019 at 4:00 p.m. in Conference Room #701 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Charlitta Hatch presiding as Acting Chairlady. Board members present were Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, David McCleary, Chris Reynolds, and Douglas Young.

ABSENT: Chair Ryan McGill, Carolyn Millen, and Vice Chair Victoria Watlington

ALSO PRESENT: Catherine Cooper, Senior Assistant City Attorney, Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board, and Lauren Livingston, Assistant Clerk to the Board

APPROVE AGENDA:

Ms. Hatch asked that the agenda be approved for the August 6, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Ms. Hatch asked that the minutes from the Civil Service Board meeting on July 2, 2019 be approved.

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes from the July 2, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting as submitted.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES CAPTAIN DAVE JOHNSON, LIEUTENANT KEITH CAVINESS, SERGEANT DAVID MILLER, AND CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES TRAINING REPRESENTATIVE CARA TERRANCE ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:01 P.M.

Mr. McCleary read the names of the candidates for hire for CMPD Recruit Class 184.

Michael Hogan Brinegar	Philip Edward McGimsey Jr.	Amy Anne Van Deventer
Marshall Lee Bryson	Jacob Damian Powell	Christopher John Whaley
Zachary Randolph Cahall	Bradley John Topper	

Ms. Hatch asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. The applications for Marshall Lee Bryson, Bradley John Topper, and Amy Anne Van Deventer were pulled.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:02 P.M.

CMPD representatives remained in the room during closed session.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CMPD new hires.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:13 P.M.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to return to open session.

Ms. Hatch asked for a motion to approve the applicants for hire.

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

Captain Dave Johnson stated the demographics for the applicants approved for hire for Recruit Class 184 were six white males, one African American female, and one African American male.

CMPD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:14 P.M.

CFD REPRESENTATIVES DEPUTY CHIEF JERRY WINKLES AND HUMAN RESOURCES REPRESENTATIVE TAMARA AGUILAR ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:14 P.M.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTION:

Ms. Hatch read the name of the CFD candidate for promotion.

Promotion to Fire Captain:

David J.W. Gibson		
-------------------	--	--

Ms. Hatch asked if the application should be pulled for discussion in closed session. The application was not pulled.

Ms. Hatch asked for a motion to approve the candidate for promotion.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate for promotion.

Deputy Chief Winkles stated the demographic for the promotion was one white male.

CFD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:18 P.M.

August 6, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 289
Civil Service Board

OTHER BUSINESS:

Ms. Kelly stated Civil Service Board hearings are scheduled for August 14, 2019 for a CFD suspension, for August 20 & 21, 2019 for a CMPD citation for termination, and for September 12, 2019 for a CFD suspension.

There being no further business for discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 4:27 p.m. upon a motion by Mr. McCleary and a second by Mr. Baldwin. The vote was unanimous.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

Length of meeting: 27 minutes

September 3, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 293
Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, September 3, 2019 at 4:00 p.m. in Conference Room #701 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members present were Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, and Douglas Young.

ABSENT: David McCleary

ABSENT UNTIL NOTED: Vice Chair Victoria Watlington

ALSO PRESENT: Catherine Cooper, Senior Assistant City Attorney and Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chair McGill asked that the agenda be approved for the September 3, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Chair McGill asked that the minutes from the Civil Service Board meeting on August 6, 2019 be approved.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes from the August 6, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting as submitted.

CFD REPRESENTATIVES DEPUTY CHIEF JERRY WINKLES, HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINSTRATOR TAMARA AGUILAR AND HUMAN RESOURECES ADMINISTRATOR JOI FOSTER ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:01 P.M.

CONSIDER CFD NEW HIRES:

Alexis Duty	John Maine II	Michael Miller
Andrew Dietz	Jordan Hall	Nathanael Powell
Brian Miller	Joseph Yowler	Nathyn Johnson
Bruce Riggins	Justin Privette	Nicholas Stanciu
Christopher Sellers	Keyshawn Allen	Phillip Orfan
Christopher Shelton	Kurt Tackett	Ralph Clark
Clifton Freshwater	Loukas Kalevas	Samuel Allen
Dashaun Rorie	Manuel Gasca Flores	Samuel Rivers
Deon Dobson	Mariah Grade	Scottie Mobley
Derrick Pollack	Matthew McKinney	Tyler Hoopaugh
Jacob Bobeng	Michael Claycomb	William Dobbeck
James McHutchon	Michael Dudkowski, Jr.	Zachary Melton

Chair McGill read the names of the CFD candidates for hire from recruit classes 110 and 111.

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. The applications for Mr. Manuel Gasca Flores and Mr. Nathanael Powell were pulled.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:03 P.M.

CFD representatives remained in the room during closed session.

VICE CHAIR VICTORIA WATLINGTON ENTERED INTO THE ROOM AT 4:05 P.M.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CFD new hires.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:07 P.M.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to return to open session.

Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for hire.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Ms. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for hire.

Deputy Chief Winkles stated the demographics for the applicants approved for hire for Recruit Class 110 included 12 percent minority candidates with one black male and one Hispanic male. All new hires in Recruit Class 110 were EMT certified. Recruit Class 111 included 52.6 percent minority candidates with six black males, one black female, one white female, and two Hispanic males.

Deputy Chief Winkles stated CFD is encouraging applicants to get EMT certification prior to being hired and that in recent years, CFD has not had difficulty retaining new hires.

Promotion to Firefighter Engineer:

Vanessa Roy		
-------------	--	--

Chair McGill asked if the application should be pulled for discussion in closed session. The application was not pulled.

Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the candidate for promotion.

Motion was made by Ms. Watlington, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate for promotion.

Deputy Chief Winkles stated the demographic for the promotion was one white female.

September 3, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 295
Civil Service Board

Deputy Chief Winkles stated the CFD is expanding its recruitment process and introduced Ms. Joi Foster who will be working with Human Resources in Fire Administration.

CFD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:13 P.M.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES MAJOR LISA GOELZ, CAPTAIN DAVE JOHNSON, SERGEANT DAVID MILLER, AND CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES TRAINING REPRESENTATIVE CARA TERRANCE ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:14 P.M.

Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for hire for CMPD Recruit Class 184.

Rex Allen Adkins, Jr.	Seth Eric Martin	Cartel Henry Pitters
Jabari Adio-Ajamu Barrett	Brandon Lee McKinney	Mary Kathryn Hall Ritchey
Matthew Aaron Carroll	Steven Alexander Michael	Hasun Allah Rogers
Nicholas Robert Chisholm	Chad Robert Morris	Brandon Lee Stump
Kaitlyn Marie Deering	Sarah Grace Murray	Ashton Riley Wince
Michael Ekundayo Frazer	Theodore Joseph Nelson Jr.	
Benjamin Trent Howard	Parker James Norman	
Aquandre Antwan Johnson	Evan Samuel Parker	

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. The application for Matthew Aaron Carroll was pulled.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:15 P.M.

CMPD representatives remained in the room during closed session.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Ms. Hatch, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CMPD new hires.
--

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:19 P.M.

Motion was made by Ms. Watlington, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to return to open session.

Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for hire.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.
--

Captain Dave Johnson stated the demographics for the applicants approved for hire for Recruit Class 184 were 11 white males, six black males, and four white females.

CMPD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:20 P.M.

September 3, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 296
Civil Service Board

OTHER BUSINESS:

Ms. Kelly stated Civil Service Board hearings are scheduled for September 25th and October 9th. The CSB hearing previously scheduled for September 12th was issued a Continuance and will be rescheduled. There are three CMPD termination hearings awaiting to be scheduled.

Mr. Clements stated he had recently read a 2006 FBI Study on extremists finding employment with local law enforcement and inquired on what measures CMPD takes to prevent extremism in the department. Ms. Kelly stated she would reach out to CMPD to gather further information.

There being no further business for discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 4:28 p.m. upon a motion by Mr. Baldwin and a second by Ms. Millen. The vote was unanimous.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

Length of meeting: 28 minutes

October 1, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 297
Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, October 1, 2019 at 4:00 p.m. in Conference Room #701 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members present were Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, David McCleary, and Douglas Young.

ABSENT: Carolyn Millen and Chris Reynolds

ABSENT UNTIL NOTED: Charlitta Hatch

ALSO PRESENT: Catherine Cooper, Senior Assistant City Attorney, Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board, and Emily Kunze, Staff Support

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chair McGill asked that the agenda be approved for the October 1, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting.

Motion was made by Ms. Watlington, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.

Motion was made by Ms. Watlington, seconded by Mr. Bowen, and carried unanimously to amend the agenda to move Item No. 6: Other Business up on the agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Chair McGill asked that the minutes from the Civil Service Board meeting on September 3, 2019 be approved.

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Ms. Watlington, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes from the September 3, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting as submitted.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD MEMBER CHARLITTA HATCH ARRIVED AT 4:02 P.M.

OTHER BUSINESS – CSB HEARING UPDATE:

Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board, discussed the future hearing schedule. She said that there is a hearing scheduled for next week on October 9, 2019 and there are nine more hearings pending but not yet scheduled. Ms. Kelly requested that board members provide their availability for the next few months.

Ms. Kelly said that Lauren Livingston, staff support, was promoted and that Ms. Kelly is currently in the process of recruiting to fill the vacancy.

Ms. Kelly mentioned that Officer Johnson had prepared a memo regarding a question from Mr. Clements regarding extremists finding employment with local law enforcement. She said the memo did not make

it into the board member packets this week, but that he would be available to speak more about the issue later in the meeting.

CFD REPRESENTATIVES CHIEF REGINALD JOHNSON, HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINSTRATOR TAMARA AGUILAR AND HUMAN RESOURECES ADMINISTRATOR JOI FOSTER ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:06 P.M.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO FIREFIGHTER II:

Matthew I. Bosnick	Winston A. Haney	Patrick M. Stanley
Christopher R. Bowman	William B. Hill	Spencer A. Starnes
Christopher R. Colbert	Holly F. Johnson	Jacob A. Stewart
Chad W. Davenport	Khalif A. Johnson	Mitchell S. Sutton
Matthew B. Egner	Clayton W. Johnston	Christopher J. Turner
Donovan L. Fletcher	Cody C. Llewellyn	Rusty A. Watts
Malachi D. Ford	Eric Maks	Dustan N. Williams
Dexter S. Freeman	James D. Meyer	Wilkinson J. Williams
Michael M. Ganzert, Jr.	Datwain J. Shipp	
Matthew A. Giannini, Jr.	Nicholas J. Shriner	

Chair McGill read the names of the CFD candidates for promotion to Firefighter II. Chief Johnson said that Dustan N. Williams should not be on the list, his name was submitted in error. He said that after further review the Fire Department was not promoting Dustan N. Williams

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to strike Dustan N. Williams from the promotion list.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the promotions for the above listed Firefighters to Firefighter II.

Chief Johnson read the demographics for the promoted firefighters. He stated out of the 27 promotions, there were 19 white males, six black males, one Asian male, and one white female.

Chair McGill read the name of the CFD candidate for promotion to Fire Captain.

Darren O. Hedgepeth

Motion was made by Ms. Watlington, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the promotion for Darren O. Hedgepeth to Fire Captain.

CFD REPRESENTATIVES LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:09 P.M.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES MAJOR LISA GOELZ, CAPTAIN DAVE JOHNSON, SERGEANT DAVID MILLER, AND CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES TRAINING REPRESENTATIVE CARA TERRANCE ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:10 P.M.

Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for hire for CMPD Recruit Class 184.

Cameron Matthew Babine	Jacob Landry Garretson	Natalia Andrea Robayo
Matthew Paul Baltimore	Jacob McKinley Grigg	Caroline Nicole Roche
Logan Chase Beck	Bryan Andres Grisales Rios	Kayla Elizabeth Sickle
Jatasha Nicole Bias	Christopher Thomas Hagan	Haley Marie Stroud
Spencer Paul Biondo	Lamed Jaramillo	Din-Huy Pham Thai
Clemont Alfred Brown III	Corey NaShawn Johnson	Long Thanh Vo
Kyle Robert Brown	Kristian Paris Kurtzke	Hunter Andrew White
Stephen Todd Farmer	Scott Anthony McCall	Heather Lynn Wyatt
Daniel Ernesto Garcia	Benjamin Ned McRary	

Chair McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. The applications for Cameron Matthew Babine, Jatasha Nicole Bias, Stephen Todd Farmer, Jacob Landry Garretson, Lamed Jaramillo, Corey NaShawn Johnson, Kayla Elizabeth Sickle, Dinh-Huy Pham Thai, and Heather Lynn Wyatt were pulled.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Ms. Hatch, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CMPD new hires.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:13 P.M.

CMPD representatives remained in the room during closed session.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Bowen, and carried unanimously to return to open session.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:33 P.M.

Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for hire.

Motion was made by Ms. Hatch, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

Captain Dave Johnson stated the demographics for the applicants approved for hire for Recruit Class 184 were 13 white males, two black males, two Asian males, two Hispanic males, five white females, one black female, and, one Hispanic female.

October 1, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 300
Civil Service Board

Captain Dave Johnson spoke to the board about the memo that he wrote regarding the department's screening process for police officers to ensure there are no extremists joining the department. He said they do an extensive background check prior to hire, the hires are under close supervision in the academy for six months, and after graduation they are in a police car with a training officer for four months. He said that recruits are under close supervision for almost two years. He added that the department screens the recruits' social media accounts too.

CMPD PERSONNEL LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:40 P.M.

There being no further business for discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 4:44 p.m. upon a motion by Mr. Baldwin and a second by Ms. Hatch. The vote was unanimous.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

Length of meeting: 40 minutes

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, November 5, 2019 at 4:05 p.m. in Conference Room #701 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Charlitta Hatch presiding in absence of the Chair and Vice Chair. Board members present were Kyle Clements, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Douglas Young, David McCleary, Charlitta Hatch, Tom Baldwin, and Assistant City Attorney Bert Concepcion filling in for Senior Assistant City Attorney Catherine Cooper.

ABSENT: Chairman Ryan McGill and Vice Chair Victoria Watlington.

ALSO PRESENT: Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board, and Stephanie Bucciarelli, Staff Support.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Ms. Hatch asked that the agenda be approved for the November 5, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Ms. Hatch asked that the minutes from the Civil Service Board meeting on October 1, 2019 be approved.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes from the October 1, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting as submitted.

Ms. Kelly introduced Mrs. Stephanie Bucciarelli, staff support, to the board as the new Assistant City Clerk for Boards and Commissions.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES MAJOR LISA GOELZ, CAPTAIN DAVE JOHNSON, SERGEANT DAVID MILLER, AND CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES TRAINING REPRESENTATIVE CARA TERRANCE ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:06 P.M.

Ms. Hatch read the names of the candidates for hire for CMPD's Lateral and/or Recruit Class 185.

Daquan Jamar Boyce	Travis Denzel Diggs	Tyler James Luby
Mathew Dwayne Pils	Lucas Dillon Spears	

Ms. Hatch asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. The application for Tyler Luby was pulled.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Ms. Hatch, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CMPD new hires.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:07 P.M.

CMPD representatives remained in the room during closed session.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to return to open session.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:11 P.M.

Ms. Hatch asked for a motion to approve the applicants for hire.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

Captain Dave Johnson stated the demographics for the applicants approved for hire for Recruit Class 185 were three white males and two black males.

At this time Captain Dave Johnson answered questions regarding training criteria for Sheriff Deputies in comparison to CMPD Officers. He also announced Major Lisa Goelz upcoming retirement to the board.

CFD REPRESENTATIVES CHIEF REGINALD JOHNSON, DEPUTY CHIEF JERRY WINKLES, AND HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINSTRATOR TAMARA AGUILAR ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:14 P.M.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO FIREFIGHTER II:

Dustan Williams		
-----------------	--	--

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO FIREFIGHTER ENGINEER:

Brian Gilmore	Ernest Wright	
---------------	---------------	--

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO FIRE CAPTAIN:

Nicholas Henderson		
--------------------	--	--

Mr. McCleary read the names of the CFD candidates for promotions to Firefighter II, Firefighter Engineer, and Fire Captain.

No applications were pulled to be reviewed by the board.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the promotions for the above listed Firefighters to Firefighter II, Firefighter Engineer, and Fire Captain, respectively.

Chief Johnson stated the demographics for the promoted firefighters

CFD REPRESENTATIVES LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:15 P.M.

OTHER BUSINESS – CSB HEARING UPDATE:

Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board, discussed the upcoming hearing schedule. She said the next hearing is scheduled for Wednesday December 4, 2019 and there are 8 more hearings pending but not yet scheduled. Ms. Kelly confirmed the panel of board members who will be participating in the upcoming hearing.

Mr. McCleary announced his recent summons to Federal Jury Duty the week of December 2, 2019. He mentioned that he did not know the duration of the summons at this time and that it might interfere with him attending the Wednesday December 4, 2019 hearing. Following this announcement, Mr. Clements volunteered to fill Mr. McCleary's seat, if the need arises.

Ms. Kelly also mentioned that Chair McGill requested the Civil Service Board meeting scheduled for Tuesday December 2, 2019 to be moved to Tuesday December 17, 2019, citing McGill's obligation to military service. The board consented to move the meeting date to Tuesday December 17, 2019 at 4:00 pm.

There being no further business for discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 4:25 p.m. upon a motion by Mr. Baldwin and a second by Mr. McCleary. The vote was unanimous.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

Length of meeting: 20 minutes

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, December 3, 2019 at 4:03 p.m. in Conference Room #701 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Charlitta Hatch presiding in the absence of the Chair and Vice Chair. Board members present were Douglas Young, Carolyn Millen, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, Chris Reynolds, Tom Baldwin, and David McCleary.

ABSENT: Chair Ryan McGill

ALSO PRESENT: Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board, Catherine Cooper, Board Attorney, and Stephanie Bucciarelli, Staff Support.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Charlitta Hatch asked that the agenda be approved for the December 3, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting.

Motion was made by Tom Baldwin, seconded by Carolyn Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.
--

APPROVE MINUTES:

Charlitta Hatch asked that the minutes from the Civil Service Board meeting on November 5, 2019 be approved.

Motion was made by Carolyn Millen, seconded by Tom Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes from the November 5, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting as submitted.
--

CFD REPRESENTATIVES CHIEF REGINALD JOHNSON, DEPUTY FIRE CHIEF JERRY WINKLES, AND HUMAN RESOURCES ADMINSTRATOR TAMARA AGUILAR ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:04 P.M.

David McCleary read the names of the candidates for Promotion to Firefighter Engineer.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO RANK OF FIREFIGHTER ENGINEER:

Eric Jones	David Mulet	
------------	-------------	--

David McCleary read the names of the candidates for Promotion to Fire Captain.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO RANK OF FIRE CAPTAIN:

Jason Clark		
-------------	--	--

No applications were pulled to be reviewed by the board.

Motion was made by David McCleary, seconded by Carolyn Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the promotions for the above listed Firefighters to Firefighter Engineer, and Fire Captain, respectively.

Deputy Fire Chief Winkles stated the demographics for the applicants approved for promotion were 3 white males.

CFD was also asked to discuss their building and land acquisition for future stations as the city continues to experience growth.

CFD REPRESENTATIVES LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:09 P.M.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES ROBERT LUCAS AND JAY JONES ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:10 P.M.

Doug Young read the names of the CMPD candidates for promotions to Major, Captain, Lieutenant, and Sergeant.

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTIONS TO RANK OF MAJOR:

Police Captain Tonya Arrington	Police Captain Dave Johnson	
--------------------------------	-----------------------------	--

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTIONS TO RANK OF CAPTAIN:

Police Lieutenant Brian Matthews	Police Lieutenant Lucas Veith
----------------------------------	-------------------------------

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTIONS TO RANK OF LIEUTENANT:

Police Sergeant Catina Odom	Police Sergeant Michael Smith	Police Sergeant Jesse Wood
-----------------------------	-------------------------------	----------------------------

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTIONS TO RANK OF SERGEANT:

Police Officer Brian Butler	Police Officer Shana Isenhour
Police Officer Alec LaFontaine	Police Officer David McCallum
Police Officer Cory Milbourn	Police Officer Joseph Pendergrast
Police Officer Michael Regan	Police Officer Lauren Stubblefield

Charlitta Hatch asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. No applications were pulled.

Motion was made by Tom Baldwin, seconded by Carolyn Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for promotion to Major, Captain, Lieutenant, and Sergeant, respectively.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES ROBERT LUCAS AND JAY JONES LEFT THE ROOM AT 4:09P.M.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES CAPTAIN DAVE JOHNSON, SERGEANT DAVID MILLER, AND CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES TRAINING REPRESENTATIVE CARA TERRANCE ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:15 P.M.

Charlitta Hatch read the names of the candidates for hire for CMPD's Lateral and/or Recruit Class #185.

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES:

Ian Cooper Buff	David Adam Curtis	Ryan Alexander Lewis
Joseph Daniel Muha	Dillon Tonne	

Charlitta Hatch asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. The application for Joseph Daniel Muha was pulled.

Motion was made by Tom Baldwin, seconded by David McCleary, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CMPD new hires and promotions.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:15 P.M.

CMPD representatives remained in the room during closed session.

Motion was made by Doug Young, seconded by Carolyn Millen, and carried unanimously to return to open session.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:19 P.M.

Charlitta Hatch asked for a motion to approve the applicants for hire.

Motion was made by Tom Baldwin, seconded by Doug Young, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

Captain Johnson announced there will be staff changes at the Police academy as a result of the promotions previously approved.

Mr. Baldwin inquired about the number and quality of new hires. Mr. Baldwin also wanted to know if CMPD has a point of view with some officer's remaining at the same station they've been at for years, versus, others who move on to another location or position.

To this, Captain Johnson responded that CMPD is 169 candidates short of the hiring goal and would not be hiring more recruits for the remainder of the year. He mentioned the number can fluctuate with officers retiring or leaving the department.

Ms. Millen asked about the applicants being subjective for leadership qualities after they reach the Sergeant level. She also wanted to know if the candidates for promotion above the level of sergeant must pass a test. Captain Johnson said that they do the same for each level of promotion with the exception of Major and above. With these higher level promotions, an in-person interview is also scheduled to select the proper candidate.

Ms. Millen's final request was that the board be provided demographics for all tiers of officers including sergeants, lieutenants, majors and captains.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:20 P.M.

OTHER BUSINESS – CSB HEARING UPDATE AND GRADUATION:

Stephanie Kelly reminded the board that the CMPD promotional ceremony on Friday December 6th at 10am, and that the 183rd Recruit Class Graduation ceremony would be Friday December 13th at 10am, at the Training Academy. She encouraged members to attend both ceremonies, if schedules allow.

Stephanie Kelly also mentioned that the number of hearings hadn't changed and that the hearing scheduled for December 4th was cancelled as well as the hearing for December 12, 2019. She also mentioned that there are no hearings for the month of December but that there would be a two-day hearing on January 15, 2020 and January 16, 2020.

There being no further business for discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 4:25 p.m. upon a motion by Tom Baldwin and a second by Carolyn Millen. The vote was unanimous.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

April 16, 2019
Minute Book 17, Page No. 277
Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met at the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police and Fire Academy located at 1750 Shopton Road on Tuesday, April 16, 2019 at 8:30 A.M. Chair Ryan McGill, Tom Baldwin, Charlitta Hatch, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, and Douglas Young were all present.

ABSENT UNTIL NOTED: Vice Chair Victoria Watlington

ABSENT: Kyle Clements, David McCleary

ALSO PRESENT: Lauren Livingston, Assistant Clerk to the Board

VISIT CHARLOTTE-MECKLENBURG FIRE DEPARTMENT ACADEMY:

At 8:30 A.M., Charlotte Fire Human Resources Manager Kristi Kjeldsen showed the Civil Service Board the CFD training academy and explained the recruitment and hiring process for CFD firefighters. CFD officials provided a tour and explanation of the CFD Candidate Physical Ability Test. The Civil Service Board observed various applicants complete the test.

VISIT THE CHARLOTTE-MECKLENBURG POLICE DEPARTMENT ACADEMY:

At 9:30 A.M., CMPD Captain Dave Johnson and Sergeant David Miller provided a tour of the Police Academy.

VICTORIA WATLINGTON ARRIVED AT 9:49 A.M.

At 9:52 A.M., CMPD Captain Dave Johnson and Sergeant David Miller gave a presentation on the recruitment and hiring process of CMPD officers.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RECESSED FOR LUNCH AT 12:00 P.M.

LAUREN LIVINGSTON LEFT AT 12:00 P.M.

After lunch, Sergeant Shane Edmunds provided an overview and tour of the CMPD training procedures, policies and facilities.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD TRAINING CONCLUDED AT 4:00 P.M.



Lauren Livingston, Assistant Clerk to the Board

Length of meeting: 7 hours and 30 minutes

January 7, 2020
Minute Book 17, Page No. 233
Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, January 7, 2019 at 4:00 p.m. in Conference Room #701 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members present were Tom Baldwin, Ryan McGill, Doug Young, Carolyn Millen, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, David McCleary, and Chris Reynolds.

ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board, Catherine Cooper, Board Attorney, Stephanie Bello, Deputy City Clerk, and Stephanie Bucciarelli, Staff Support.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chair McGill asked that the revised agenda be approved for the January 7, 2020 Civil Service Board meeting.

Motion was made by Carolyn Millen, seconded by David McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.

ELECT VICE CHAIR:

David McCleary motioned to nominate Charlitta Hatch as Vice Chair. Kyle Clements seconded the motion. Tom Baldwin made a motion to close nominations, seconded by Doug Young. The vote was unanimous.

Motion was made by David McCleary, seconded by Carolyn Millen, and carried unanimously to elect Charlitta Hatch as Vice Chair.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Chair McGill asked that the minutes from the Civil Service Board meeting on December 3, 2019 be approved.

David McCleary asked that there be an amendment made to the Closed Session Minutes to include his name.

Motion was made by Carolyn Millen, seconded by Tom Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes, with the noted amendment for the December 3, 2019 Civil Service Board meeting.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES MAJOR DAVE JOHNSON, SERGEANT DAVID MILLER, LIEUTENANT KEITH CAVINESS AND CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES TRAINING REPRESENTATIVE CARA TERRANCE ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:06 P.M.

Chair McGill read the names of the candidates for hire.

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES:

Manuel Aguinaga	Kenneth Brock Bost	Raykel Anne Bruno-Prisco
Henry Kenneth Buhr Jr	Tracy Alexander Cruse III	Alexander Ferrera
Brandon Edward Graham	Kristina Lynn Helms	Matthew Lee Hsieh
Nicolas Wyatt Jones	Kenneth Lee Kludy	Edouard Albert Larente
Jonathan Patrick Nugent	David Charles Ross Jr	Michael Francis Ruballo
Andrew Thomas Rudd	Ryan Nicholas Sellers	Jacob Daniel Sloan
Lindsey Nicole Stapleton		

Chairman McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. The applications for Kenneth Brock Bost, Alexander Ferrera, Nicolas Wyatt Jones, Michael Francis Ruballo, and Lindsey Nicole Stapleton were pulled.

Motion was made by Carolyn Millen, seconded by Charlitta Hatch, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CMPD new hires.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENETERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:09 P.M.

CMPD representatives remained in the room during closed session.

Motion was made by David McCleary, seconded by Tom Baldwin, and carried unanimously to return to open session.

CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:34 P.M.

Chair McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for hire.

Motion was made by Doug Young, seconded by Carolyn Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

Lieutenant Caviness stated the demographics for the applicants approved for new hires were 13 white males, 2 Hispanic males, 3 white females, and 1 Asian male.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:35 P.M.

CFD REPRESENTATIVES CHIEF REGINALD JOHNSON, DEPUTY FIRE CHIEF JERRY WINKLES, AND CFD HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGER KIM SANDERS, CITY HUMAN RESOURCES DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAULA RINNIX, AND HUMAN RESOURCES ORGANIZATIONAL DEVELOPMENT CONSULTANT CATHY LUTHER, ENETERED THE ROOM AT 4:36 P.M.

The fire department human resources representatives introduced themselves to the board. The board members in turn introduce themselves.

Before reading the names of the CFD promotion candidates, Deputy Chief Winkles advised that Shane Nantz withdrew his retirement as well as another Battalion Chief, not mentioned by name. So, the list of promotions was revised from what was originally provided.

They removed Michael Carter's promotion to Fire Captain, as well as Sylvia Smith-Phifer's promotion to Battalion Chief. Board member Chris Reynolds inquired about the promotional process when a situation such as this arises.

Fire Chief Johnson addressed her concerns stating that there is an eligibility list based on test scores from a third-party vendor. The rule he followed, Rule Nine, states that the Chief can choose candidates to promote on his own or work his way down the list. He decided to go down the list ranked by score so that he can remain impartial as to who is promoted.

Chair McGill read the name of the revised CFD promotion candidates.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO FIRE CAPTAIN:

Michael Carter		
---------------------------	--	--

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO BATTALION CHIEF:

Thomas Clymer II	Sylvia Smith-Phifer
-----------------------------	--------------------------------

No applications were pulled.

Motion was made by David McCleary, seconded by Tom Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion.
--

Chair McGill read the names of the CFD new hires for Recruit Class 112.

CONSIDER CFD NEW HIRES:

Anthony Bortny	Monique Carlson	Jesse Chillemi
Adam Freeman	Alexander Goodrich	Brian King
Matthew Kinsey	Graham Lawrence	Gregory Lilly
Cody McCray	Zachery Miller	Zachery Pope
William Spencer	Jerome Taylor	

Applications for Adam Freeman and Cody McCray were pulled.

Motion was made by Tom Baldwin, seconded by Chris Reynolds, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CMPD new hires and promotions.

Motion was made by Carolyn Millen, seconded by Charlitta Hatch, and carried unanimously to remove the two candidates from the proposed new hire roster.

Motion was made by Charlitta Hatch, seconded by Tom Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD roster recommended for hire.

Deputy Chief Winkles states the demographics for the applicants approved for hire were 25% minority.

Carolyn Millen inquired if there is a way to prevent people withdrawing from retirement or leaving, thus taking the chance of promotion away from other individuals. Chief Johnson advised that this is an internal CFD issue that they are aware of.

Ms. Millen also asked how the fallout is handled in these scenarios. Chief Johnson explained how this is handled and stated formal notification comes only after approval of the Civil Service Board.

Ms. Millen followed up by inquiring about CFD's recruitment in schools and college job fairs and if any minorities or women attend them. Mr. Winkles informed the Board that CFD didn't establish a recruitment division until 2017. He also advised that CFD doesn't have the resources or staffing required to do proper recruitment in comparison to CMPD. Chief Johnson added in that more modern and effective methods of recruitment come from social media marketing and holding sessions at Middle Schools with students.

In the future, Chief Johnson would like to have a cadet program to accept graduates straight out of high school just like CMPD does. Currently, adjunct recruiters do go to schools. He also advised that CFD is behind on recruiting females and only has 38 females employed at this time.

While on the subject of recruitment, Deputy Chief Winkles passed out information folders for a new recruit testing process that CFD would like to implement. The company is Morris/McDaniel. He stated CFD searched for a company that has done large cities and that this company had worked with the City of Austin, Texas and the state of New York. CFD is searching for a more efficient process to keep up with the turnover rate. They also want to speed up the process, so they can hire more and have quarterly interviews and candidates to keep up with diversity and quality. This is also an attempt to stay ahead of the curve of retirees. Chris Reynolds asked how firefighters give their notice. Chief Johnson said that normally they get about a month's notice due to pay dates.

Deputy Chief Winkles also stated that currently they have a written test phase then in the second phase they do a physical interview and finally a medical review and panel interview. The new company would have phase one as a structured oral test done in a large room of people, but they would record the individual's answer and be graded. The new phase would move into the physical test and panel interview.

The board consulted with Attorney Cooper about the process, whereupon she advised that CFD can take the Civil Service Board's opinion into consideration but can move ahead on their own. CFD said that they

were open to further questions about their new testing process. Chair McGill asked that any question about the new testing vendor be provided to the City Clerk's Office by January 17, 2020.

CFD REPRESENTATIVE LEFT THE MEETING AT 5:23 P.M.

a. Approval of the 2019 Annual Report:

Clerk Stephanie Kelly explained that the draft of the annual report, once finalized and approved, will be provided to the City Council during their upcoming retreat. City Council requested staff provide annual reports from all advisory boards using a template that provides an overview of each board's activity for the year.

After the discussion about the draft and suggested edits, Chairman McGill requested approval, with the edits discussed.

Motion was made by Carolyn Millen, seconded by David McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the 2019 Annual Report as amended.

b. CSB Hearings Update:

1. Clerk Stephanie Kelly announced that Officer Mazzeo's hearing was scheduled for Thursday January 16 & 17, 2020.

After the update, the discussion it was discovered that members who were scheduled to participate had not been notified in time to reserve those dates. That said, the hearing was postponed and will be rescheduled.

As for these hearings, none have been confirmed at this time but, staff is looking at tentative dates of February 11, 2020, February 12, 2020, and February 13, 2020, each for 1-day CFD suspension hearings.

2. She also announced that there are 5 CMPD hearings and 5 hearings for CFD pending.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, February 4, 2019 at 4:00 P.M. in Conference Room #701 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members present were Tom Baldwin, Ryan McGill, Doug Young, Carolyn Millen, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, and Chris Reynolds.

ABSENT UNTIL NOTED: David McCleary

ALSO PRESENT: Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board, Catherine Cooper, Board attorney, Stephanie Bello, Deputy Clerk, and Stephanie Bucciarelli, Staff Support.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chairman McGill asked that the agenda be approved for the February 4, 2020 Civil Service Board meeting.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.
--

APPROVE MINUTES:

Mrs. Kelly distributed a marked up draft version of the January 7, 2020 minutes and recommended approval of the January 7, 2020 minutes as corrected.

Chairman McGill asked that the minutes from the Civil Service Board meeting on January 7, 2020 be approved.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes as corrected.
--

CFD REPRESENTATIVES CHIEF REGINALD JOHNSON, DEPUTY FIRE CHIEF JERRY WINKLES, AND CFD HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGER KIM SANDERS ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:03 P.M.

Chairman McGill read the name of the revised CFD promotion candidate list.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO FIRE ENGINEER:

	Gregory Short	
--	---------------	--

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate recommended for promotion.
--

Chairman McGill read the names of the CFD new hires for Recruit Class 112.

CONSIDER CFD NEW HIRES:

Adam Freeman	Cody McCray	
--------------	-------------	--

Application for Adam Freeman was pulled.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CFD new hires and promotions.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:04 P.M.

CFD remained in the room during closed session.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:05 P.M.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Ms. Hatch, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD roster recommended for hire.

Ms. Reynolds inquired about the demographics of the recruit class from the start of the training program versus graduation.

Deputy Chief Winkles advised that normally people stay through the entire program; however, things can happen that cause some recruits to leave before graduation. He also added that the program is 8 weeks long and must adhere to state protocol.

Ms. Reynolds further inquired how many openings CFD currently has. Deputy Chief Winkles explained that there are currently 37 openings and they are working with Strategy and Budget to work on filling vacancies. Chief Johnson supplemented that with the budget and new hiring process being implemented, that CFD will be able to hire enough candidates to keep up with firefighters retiring and leaving.

Mr. Baldwin asked about the average tenure of a firefighter at CFD, to which Chief Johnson answered that most remain until retirement.

CFD REPRESENTATIVES LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:12 P.M.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES MAJOR DAVE JOHNSON, CAPTAIN JACQUELYN BRYLEY, SERGEANT DAVID MILLER, LIEUTENANT KEITH CAVINESS, AND CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES TRAINING REPRESENTATIVE CARA TERRANCE ENTERED THE ROOM AT 4:12 P.M.

Mr. McCleary arrived at 4:14 P.M.

Chairman McGill read the names of the candidates for hire.

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES:

Ahshon Ammon	Tucker Armstrong	Derek Atkinson
Rebecca Bogart	Chol Min Chi	James Thomas Conner
Derric Entwistle	Matthew Flannigan	Marilynn Gilfillan
Yael Grazier-Zerbarini	Kendall Haines	Sean Husk
Cory Mauldin	Khadijah Muhammad	Gabriel Nazco
Hung Thanh Phan	Lucas Robinson	Kaleb Sherman
Tawan Skeen	Avery Vista	Ryan Wood

Chairman McGill asked if any applications should be pulled for discussion in closed session. The applications for Derric Entwistle, Kendall Haines, and Tawan Skeen were pulled.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CMPD new hires.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:15 P.M.

CMPD representatives remained in the room during closed session.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to return to open session.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:23 P.M.

Chairman McGill asked for a motion to approve the applicants for hire.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

Ms. Reynolds asked CMPD what do the demographics look like at the beginning of the academy training compared to the graduating class. CMPD stated that initially there were 27 White males, 3 Black males, 2 Hispanic males, 3 Asian males, 1 Other male, 4 White females, and 3 Black females.

Ms. Hatch asked CMPD if they could, in the future, provide the demographics between trainers and diverse candidates.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVES LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:26 P.M.

a. CSB Hearings Update:

The hearing scheduled for February 11, 2020 has been rescheduled to Tuesday February 25, 2020 to accommodate everyone's schedule involved in the hearing process. As of now, we only have one volunteer for that day's hearing, Ms. Reynolds. The Clerk's Office asked for two more volunteers for that date. Ms. Millen and Mr. Baldwin volunteered.

b. Announcements:

Mrs. Kelly announced that the Mayor and City Council will be holding a Volunteer Appreciation Event on April 6th from 4-5PM. She also stated that the Mayor and City Council would be in attendance.

The final announcement came from Catherine Cooper, who announced her retirement as of March 1, 2020.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:47 P.M.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

Length of meeting: 1 hour 46 minutes

March 3, 2020
Minute Book 17, Page No. 234
Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session on Tuesday, March 3, 2020 at 4:00 P.M. in Conference Room #701 of the Charlotte Mecklenburg Government Center, 600 E. Fourth Street, with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members present were Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, Carolyn Millen, David McCleary, Chris Reynolds and Doug Young.

ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Board Attorney Catherine Cooper and Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chairman McGill asked that the agenda be approved for the March 3, 2020 Civil Service Board meeting.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Chairman McGill asked if there were corrections to the minutes from the Civil Service Board meeting on February 4, 2020 be approved.

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes as presented.

CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES REPRESENTATIVE ROBERT LUCAS ENTERED THE MEETING ROOM AT 4:03 P.M.

Chairman McGill read the names of the officers recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTIONS TO RANK OF SERGEANT:

Officer Quentin Blakeney	Officer Wayne Goode	Officer Thomas Grosse
Officer Eric Schneider		

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for promotion.

Ms. Millen requested a breakdown on the number of candidates under consideration for promotions and the associated demographics. Mr. Lucas explained the Department used the “Rule of Five” as the basis to determine eligibility for this promotion. He further noted the promotions process is assessed by a third party to ensure equity.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVE LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:07 PM.

CFD REPRESENTATIVES CHIEF REGINALD JOHNSON, CFD HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGER KIM SANDERS AND HUMAN RESOURCES ASSISTANT JOI FOSTER ENTERED THE MEETING AT 4:07 PM.

Chairman McGill read the names of the CFD candidates recommended for promotions.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTION TO FIREFIGHTER ENGINEER:

Christopher Formyduval

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Ms. Hatch, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTION TO FIRE CAPTAIN:

Michael Carter

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CFD NEW HIRES:

Upon the department's request, the applications for Joshua Gosselin and David Troiani were pulled.

Chairman McGill read the names of the CFD revised list of new hires for Recruit Class 113.

Hunter Allen	Caleb Eudy	Nicholas Grigoletti
Robert Honeycutt	Justin Jones	Nicholas Kelly
Michael Mabron, Jr.	Brandon Mulligan	Jacob Piraino
Bert Smith	Bernard Turbiak	Kevin Turner

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CFD new hires.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:11 P.M.

CFD representatives remained in the room during closed session.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:12 P.M.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD roster recommended for hire.

Chief Johnson cited the demographics for this class as 10 WM, 2 BM, with 17% diversity. He stated that if all candidates for this class are approved, the total candidates from the 2019 process will be 62 (with 31% diversity).

Ms. Reynolds raised a question about the training process. In response, Chief Johnson provided details on training for the EMT Certification and new requirements CFD is implementing with regard to EMT training. He mentioned the first class from the 2019 process, Recruit Class 110, was hired in September 2019 and graduated in February 2020. There were 17 hired into an all-EMT class with all graduating. From that class, the demographics were 15 WM, 1 BM, 1 HM (12% diversity).

Ms. Hatch questioned if CFD is tracking on gender diversity. Chief Johnson stated he expects to see greater diversity as a result of having begun work last month with a new 3rd party vendor.

There was discussion about ways the department is looking to amp up their recruiting efforts. Chief Johnson shared a recent occurrence; For their annual entrance exam, there were 1000 applicants; 600 of those registered showed up for the exam.

OTHER BUSINESS:

a. Hearings Update:

A two-day termination hearing is confirmed for April 7th & 8th

1. Ryan McGill (Chair)
2. Doug Young
3. Kyle Clements
4. Charlitta Hatch
5. Carolyn Millen

Remaining hearings:

<u>Dept</u>	<u>Term/Sus</u>	<u>Date</u>
CFD (1)	Suspension	None
CMPD (5)	Termination	None

b. Announcements

Mr. McCleary announced he has a schedule conflict with the April meeting.

Chairman McGill stated he has a schedule conflict with the August and September meetings.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:27 P.M.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

March 3, 2020
Minute Book 17, Page No. 234
Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session by teleconference on Tuesday, April 7 at 4:04 P.M. with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members present were Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, Carolyn Millen, David McCleary, Chris Reynolds and Doug Young.

ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Andrea Leslie-Fite, Board Attorney and Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board

CALL TO ORDER: Chairman McGill called the meeting to order at 4:04 PM and read the following statement: "Today's Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted via teleconference to support the essential services of the Police and Fire during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. Pursuant to this Board's Rules of Procedure, the Agenda will be limited to consideration of promotions and new hires. All board members and City staff are asked to please identify themselves and be recognized by the Chair so we make certain speakers are clearly identified for the minutes of this meeting."

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chairman McGill asked that the agenda be approved for the April 7, 2020 Civil Service Board meeting.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.
--

CMPD HUMAN RESOURCES REPRESENTATIVE ROBERT LUCAS JOINED THE TELECONFERENCE CALL AT 4:04 P.M.

Chairman McGill read the names of the officers recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTIONS TO RANK OF MAJOR:

Captain Jacquelyn Bryley	Captain Robert Dance	Captain Brian Foley
--------------------------	----------------------	---------------------

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTIONS TO RANK OF CAPTAIN:

Lieutenant Brian Trull

Motion was made by Ms. Hatch, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidate recommended for promotion.
--

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTIONS TO RANK OF LIEUTENANT:

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidate recommended for promotion.

CMPD REPRESENTATIVE LEFT THE MEETING AT 4:07 PM.

CMPD RECRUITMENT AND TRAINING REPRESENTATIVES SERGEANT DAVID MILLER AND CAPTAIN JULIE BARRY JOINED THE TELECONFERENCE CALL AT 4:08 PM.

Chairman McGill read the names of the CMPD candidates recommended for hire as members of a Lateral Class and/or Recruit Class #186:

Edward Joseph Ciccone	Phillip Matthew Geisler	Christopher Allan Holmes
Travis Durham Honeycutt	Alexa Taylor Hostetler	Trenton Allen Nash
Matthew Roy Wilson		

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD roster recommended for hire.

OTHER BUSINESS:

a. Update on hearings:

The Clerk stated the hearing originally scheduled for April 7-8 was cancelled and that the Chair granted a continuance until the end of July. She also read the following statement that was provided to others scheduled to participate in the hearing: "In light of the COVID-19 pandemic; the resulting state-wide Stay in Place Order, and guidance from the UNC-School of Government and North Carolina Court System concerning Due Process requirements for quasi-judicial hearings, **all** hearings will be rescheduled to a later date. Parties will be notified of the rescheduled date and time."

b. Board Attorney Leslie-Fite reported she is working on draft language related to scheduling of Board hearings for the Board's consideration.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:19 P.M.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

Length of meeting: 15 minutes

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met in regular session by teleconference call on Tuesday, May 5, 2020 at 4:01 P.M. with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members present were Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds and Doug Young.

ABSENT: Board member David McCleary

ALSO PRESENT: Andrea Leslie-Fite, Board Attorney and Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board

CALL TO ORDER: Chairman McGill called the meeting to order at 4:01 PM and read the following statement: "Today's Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted via teleconference to support the essential services of the Police and Fire during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. Pursuant to this Board's Rules of Procedure, the Agenda will be limited to consideration of promotions and new hires. All board members and City staff are asked to please identify themselves and be recognized by the Chair, so we make certain speakers are clearly identified for the minutes of this meeting."

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chairman McGill asked that the agenda be approved for the May 5, 2020 Civil Service Board meeting.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.
--

APPROVE MINUTES:

Chairman McGill asked for approval of the minutes from the March 3, 2020 and April 7, 2020 meetings.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of March 3, 2020 as submitted.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of April 7, 2020 as submitted.

CFD REPRESENTATIVES CHIEF REGINALD JOHNSON, DEPUTY CHIEF JERRY WINKLES AND CFD HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGER KIM SANDERS JOINED THE MEETING AT 4:01 PM.

Chairman McGill read the names of the candidates recommended for promotions.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO FIREFIGHTER ENGINEER:

Randel Adkins	Samuel Capps, Jr.	Jerry Harris, Jr.
---------------	-------------------	-------------------

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO FIRE CAPTAIN:

Michael Ferreira, Jr.	Kevin Gordon	Leyungio Hall
Richard Hunning	Hunter Meadows	

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO BATTALION CHIEF:

Robert Fitzgerald	Sylvia Smith-Phifer	
-------------------	---------------------	--

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO DIVISION FIRE CHIEF:

Reuben Fitzgerald	
-------------------	--

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion.

Deputy Fire Chief Winkles presented an overview of the department's new process for Firefighter II (FF II) competency testing. He explained the process was developed with input and recommendations from a 2019 CFD Work Group comprised of a cross section of employees from within the department. The creation of the 2020 Firefighter II competency test is scheduled to take place during the week of May 18-22, 2020. There will be approximately fifty candidates who will be eligible to apply for promotion to the rank of FF II in 2020. Deputy Chief Winkles explained the way the work group reviewed the job description and the skills necessary to perform the FF II job. He further noted the competency testing process was validated and approved by the City's Human Resources Department. He explained the candidates will be tested on four different skills and graded on a 100-point scale. A candidate must score a minimum of 70 points in order to pass, without failing any of the four stations. A failure of one of the four skill stations will disqualify a candidate. Deputy Chief Winkles described each of the four stations – 1) Residential Burn Building; 2) Truck Town Prop; 3) Pump Pit #3; 4) Shed 4 - which includes a EMS Practical scenario, representing 70% of the FF II job.

Deputy Chief Winkles responded to questions raised by Board members.

Chief Johnson reported on the Department's completion of the 2020 promotions process, using a third-party vendor. He noted the Captain's process was the same as last year, while minor changes were made

to the Battalion Chief and Division Chief's process. He explained how they integrated written tests and assessment centers as a part of this year's process.

Chief Johnson responded to questions raised by Board members.

CFD representatives left the call at 4:25 pm.

CMPD RECRUITMENT AND TRAINING REPRESENTATIVES SERGEANT DAVID MILLER, LIEUTENANT CAVINESS AND CAPTAIN JULIE BARRY JOINED THE TELECONFERENCE CALL AT 4:29 PM.

Chairman McGill read the names of the CMPD candidates recommended for hire as members of a Lateral Class and/or Recruit Class #186:

Jonathan Mark Adams	Jared Adam Gardner	Tobey Erin Rocket
Owen Jacob Bailey	Patrick Allen-Biller Gardner	Tracy Drennan Rogers
Nicholas Evan Bowman	John Matthew Gott	Marquis Carver Sivels, II
Matthew Arnet Choice	Tyima Barbara Johnson	Stephen Andrew Swoope
David Donovan Cristy	Michael Alexander King	Ashley Nicole Wingo
Brandon Christopher Fowler	Galen Quinn Kloepfer	
Cintya Esmeralda Garcia	Pierre Darius LeLeux	

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CMPD new hires.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:32 P.M. by DISCONNECTING FROM THE ORIGINAL TELEPHONE CALL AND REDIALING TO CONFIRM ONLY THE ATTENDANCE OF THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK AND CMPD REPRESENTATIVES.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:41 P.M.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD applicants recommended for hire.

CMPD provided demographics for the new hires as: 10 WM, 2 BM, 2 BF, 3 HM, 1 HF, 1 AI.

CMPD representatives left the meeting at 4:43 P.M.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD roster recommended for hire.

OTHER BUSINESS:

a. Consider Process for Scheduling CSB Hearings:

The Board was presented a draft of the proposed resolution in advance of the meeting.

WHEREAS, the Charlotte Civil Service Board (hereinafter "the Board") is organized pursuant to the City of Charlotte, North Carolina Charter;

WHEREAS, upon receipt of a citation for termination from either chief or upon receipt of notice of appeal for a suspension from any civil service covered police officer or firefighter, the Board shall hold a hearing and shall promptly notify the officer of the hearing date. Termination hearings shall be held with a panel (hereinafter "Hearing Panel") of five available members, and suspension hearings shall be held with a panel of three available members.

WHEREAS, the Civil Board desires to establish a regular hearing schedule for adjudication of appeals;

NOW THEREFORE be it resolved that:

1. The Board will hereby designate the first Wednesday (hereinafter "Hearing Day") of each month from 9am-5pm for disciplinary or appeal hearings;
2. Notwithstanding the establishment of Hearing Day, the Hearing Panel may allow additional time for case presentations; including establishing additional Hearing Days as may be required for completion of a hearing;
3. The Hearing Panel may hear one or more hearings on Hearing Day, subject to scheduling availability;
4. The Board may elect to establish one or more Hearing Days from time to time as may be required to resolve outstanding hearings; and
5. If there are no hearings pending, Hearing Day will be cancelled.

After brief discussion, the suggestion was made to establish Hearing Day as the fourth Wednesday of each month. Board members discussed the likelihood that some hearings, may require two days, Wednesday and Thursday.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the adoption of the resolution designating the fourth Wednesday of each month as CSB Hearing Day.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:51 P.M.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

Length of meeting: 50 minutes

May 5, 2020
Minute Book 17, Page No. 234
Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met by electronic platform on Tuesday, June 2, 2020 at 4:00 P.M. with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members attending remotely were: Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, David McCleary, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds and Doug Young.

ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Andrea Leslie-Fite, Board Attorney and Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board

CALL TO ORDER: Chairman McGill called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM and read the following statement: "Today's Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted electronically to support the essential services of the Police and Fire during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. All board members and City staff are asked to please identify themselves and be recognized by the Chair, so we make certain speakers are clearly identified for the minutes of this meeting."

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chairman McGill requested amendment of the meeting agenda to allow for legal guidance from the Board's attorney.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda as amended.

Attorney Leslie-Fite addressed the Board about correspondence forwarded to board members from Tom Brewer, President of Charlotte Fire Fighters Union #660, regarding the Fire Fighter II Promotional Process and a request from Battalion Chief Shane Nantz to address the CSB. Mrs. Leslie-Fite advised that a task force has been assembled to review several issues that have been raised within the Fire Department related to Rule IX and the City Charter. Mrs. Leslie-Fite noted that parallel conversations about the issues are underway. She further noted the task force plans to share their findings with the CSB.

Members raised questions about the task force timeline, if the CSB has a statutory requirement to respond to the correspondence received and how the task force was appointed. In response to questions, Attorney Leslie-Fite provided clarity on the purpose of the task force working under authority of the City Manager's Office, pointing out that a few members of the task force were remotely attending today's meeting to observe the monthly meeting. She further stated the CSB has no statutory requirement to respond to the correspondence that has been received. No action was taken.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Chairman McGill requested approval of minutes from the May 5, 2020 regular and closed session meetings.

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of May 5, 2020 as submitted.

DEPUTY CHIEF ESTELLA PATTERSON JOINED THE MEETING REMOTELY.

Deputy Chief Estella Patterson gave an overview of an update to CMPD's Uniform and Grooming Standards Policy, emphasizing the rationale for changes which she pointed out are timely due to the current pandemic. Deputy Chief Patterson explained that the use of a respirator is an essential and mandatory job function due to the variety of situations officers encounter. She advised the department had been operating outside of OSHA guidelines, but as of May 2020, the changes were made to better align the department with the OSHA safety standard. The policy requires officers and requisite employees to be clean-shave while on duty unless there is a job-specific function that permits a change in an employee's appearance.

Deputy Chief Patterson and CMPD Human Resources Manager Kamella Emmanuel responded to questions from board members about implementation, noncompliance, exceptions to the policy, and the military-grade masks used by the department.

CMPD RECRUITMENT AND TRAINING REPRESENTATIVES SERGEANT DAVID MILLER, LIEUTENANT CAVINESS AND CAPTAIN JULIE BARRY JOINED REMOTELY AT 4:30 PM.

Chairman McGill read the names of the CMPD candidates recommended for hire as members of Recruit Class #186:

Khallyde Mikael Alston	Colton Michael Fuller	Gregory Scott Moore
Parker Chase Baxley	Anthony Gonzalez	Christopher Thomas Murphy
Michael Edward Bedard	Denzel Jamal Green	Thomas James Robinson
Shane William Billings	Kasahn Javel Hines	Joseph Timothy Sullivan
Windell Deontre Blue	Amber Nicole Keipe	Devan Thomas Wilson
Christian Jacob Campbell	Joseph Danial Miller	
Frank Michael DeFeo	Kyle Edward Milslagle	

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CMPD new hires.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:34 P.M. BY PAUSING THE REGULAR MEETING AND JOINING ANOTHER ELECTRONIC INVITATION. THE ATTENDANCE OF THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK AND CMPD REPRESENTATIVES WAS CONFIRMED.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 5:00 P.M.

Motion was made by Mrs. Hatch, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD applicants recommended for hire.

CMPD representatives left the meeting at 5:02 P.M.

THE BOARD, BOARD ATTORNEY AND BOARD CLERK REJOINED THE PAUSED MEETING TO CONTINUE WITH THE REMAINING PORTION OF THE MEETING IN OPEN SESSION.

CFD REPRESENTATIVES CHIEF REGINALD JOHNSON, DEPUTY CHIEF JERRY WINKLES AND CFD HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGER KIM SANDERS JOINED THE MEETING.

CFD PRESENTATION ON 2020 ENGINEER'S COMPETENCY EXAM:

Deputy Chief Jerry Winkles gave an overview of the testing process, noting that the test is based on demonstration of the skills needed to perform as a fire engineer or job performance requirements. Deputy Chief Winkles stated that information was sent out for anyone interested in taking the test, which will be offered over 5 days to account for different work schedules. He stated that candidates will sign a nondisclosure agreement to maintain the integrity of the test. He further explained the candidates will be evaluated on three skill sets, which will be weighted 30% driving course, 20% FF II JPR demonstration and 50% apparatus pumping, all of which were taught during recruit class. Candidates must score a minimum of 70% on each evaluated skill.

In response to questions, Deputy Chief Winkles stated that applications will be accepted from June 1st through June 19th to establish an eligible pool of candidates for promotions. He also stated the written exam would be administered on July 21, 2020.

Chairman McGill read the names of the candidates recommended for promotions.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO FIREFIGHTER ENGINEER:

Robert Blumberg	Christopher King	Christopher Rabeau
Edward DeFranzo	Jonathan Morrison	
Omar Kasso	Raymond Murphy III	

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO FIRE CAPTAIN:

Mario Arango	Matthew Misenheimer	Timothy Smith
Eric DePoto	Todd Robitaille	
Anthony Hutto	Brett Sikes	

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO BATTALION CHIEF:

Darrick Cooper	Jeffrey Redden	
----------------	----------------	--

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to adjourn.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:25 P.M.

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Stephanie C. Kelly".

Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met by teleconference phone call on Friday, June 5, 2020 at 11:16 A.M. with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members attending remotely were: Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, David McCleary, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds and Doug Young.

ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Andrea Leslie-Fite, Board Attorney and Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board

CALL TO ORDER: Pursuant to NCGS §143-318.12 (b)(2), Chairman Ryan McGill called the special meeting of the Civil Service Board to order. A quorum of the Board was confirmed.

The purpose of the meeting was reiterated as a discussion of certain provisions of the City Charter related to the duties of the Board. Mr. McCleary referenced three photographs (photocopies of 2 Tweets and 1 email, attached as a part of the minutes of this meeting) and recommended the Civil Service Board ask Chief Kerr Putney to conduct an investigation of the incident referenced in the aforementioned Tweets and email that occurred on June 2, 2020 in accordance with Chapter 4 of the City Charter, Article III, Section 4.61(n) and report back to the board in writing.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Ms. Millen, to go into closed session pursuant to NCGS §11-413.318.11(a)(3) to consult with the Board's attorney.

Board members, Attorney Andrea Leslie-Fite and Clerk Stephanie Kelly convened in closed session on a separate teleconference number at 11:29 a.m.

The Board returned to open session at 11:58 a.m.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Ms. Hatch to require CMPD provide this board, in writing, all materials, information, documents, related to an internal review and provided to the SBI for their requested review related to the events in Uptown Charlotte on the evening of June 2, 2020; if the SBI does not investigate, the board requests CMPD use a 3rd party investigation or review to provide a full report to the board.

Mr. McCleary asserted that the Board had a responsibility to make this request due to outpouring of public concern about the June 2nd incident.

There was discussion about whether the Board could require CMPD to conduct a third-party investigation. Mrs. Leslie-Fite pointed out the Board can require an investigation but could not specify how it is conducted.

With the consent of the motion-maker, a friendly amendment was made by Ms. Hatch to clarify the original motion to now read: "...the board requests CMPD provide a full investigative report by a third-party".

Concerns were expressed by various members of the board about what the end result will be once the report is received.

The point was made that the Board is not a “rubber-stamp” board; that one of its essential duties is to review policies that reflect how the police polices the community. With that, Attorney Leslie-Fite clarified the Board’s authority as specified in the City Charter, Article III. §4.61.

Upon the Board’s request, CMPD Attorney Jessica Battle provided a review of the June 2nd incident. She noted there was no citywide curfew in place. As she recounted the incident, she stated the incident began as a result of a failure to disperse. Ms. Battle also stated that CMPD has not heard back from the SBI regarding CMPD’s request for an independent review of the incident.

In response to a question, Ms. Battle explained the term “unlawful assembly”. She explained the definition depends on whatever action is occurring at the time that takes a lawful assembly to a criminal situation.

As the discussion concluded, Ms. Battle stated she was in the process of preparing all videos to petition Superior Court for public release of video from the night in question.

Upon a restatement of the motion, the vote was recorded as unanimous.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to adjourn.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 12:40 p.m.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

Add attachments

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met by electronic platform on Tuesday, July 7, 2020 at 4:00 P.M. with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members attending remotely were: Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, David McCleary, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Ryon Smalls and Doug Young.

ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Andrea Leslie-Fite, Board Attorney and Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board

CALL TO ORDER: Chairman McGill called the meeting to order at 4:07 PM and read the following statement: "Today's Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted electronically to support the essential services of the Police and Fire during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. All board members and City staff are asked to please identify themselves and be recognized by the Chair, so we make certain speakers are clearly identified for the minutes of this meeting."

Board members introduced themselves and welcomed Ryon Smalls as the newly appointed member.

DISCUSSION WITH NEW POLICE CHIEF JOHNNY JENNINGS:

Chief Jennings expressed appreciation to the Board for their work and dedication. He mentioned that one of his expectations is that the CSB and CMPD would be able to partner together. He gave a brief overview of some of his goals as new Chief of Police, among them being: officer health and wellness, community collaboration and crime management, with focus more on violent crime arrests and looking at alternatives to discretionary misdemeanor arrests. He noted there will be changes to the way policing is done.

In response to questions from the Board, Chief Jennings expressed a desire for CSB input on policies and investigations.

Chairman McGill expressed congratulations to the new chief and stated the Board's willingness in working together.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Chairman McGill requested approval of a revised agenda, allowing for discussion with Chief Jennings as the first agenda item.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Mrs. Hatch, and carried unanimously to approve the revised agenda.
--

APPROVE MINUTES:

Chairman McGill requested approval of minutes from the June 2, 2020 regular and closed session meetings.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously (with the exception of Ryon Smalls), to approve the minutes of June 2, 2020 as submitted.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO FIREFIGHTER II:

Chairman McGill read the names of the candidates recommended for promotion to Firefighter II:

Robert Atwell	Michael Cunningham	Hector Rivera, Jr.
Chandler Beheler	David Hodnett	Matthew Ross
Colten Bell	William Jackson	Eric Sager
Devin Blake	Michelle Jordan	Brandon Sangster
Melvin Brooks, Jr.	Luke Karagias	Jacob Shope
Jesse Cadenhead	Tyler McGee	Hunter Sledge
Ethan Cato	Patrick Morgan	Dustin Sneed
Brandin Chacon	Kristopher O'Brien	Kevin Turnbull
James Clemonts III	Jason Parker	Brandon Wade
Caleb Craver	Mark Podlaski	Chad Zerfoss

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion.

Board members raised the practicality of voting on the recommended promotions before hearing concerns from CFD employees as scheduled for later in the meeting.

Substitute motion was made by Ms. Reynolds, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to amend the agenda to discuss possible revisions to promotional materials and hear CFD employee's concerns before considering the recommended promotions.

Without objection, the original motion was withdrawn by the maker of the motion.

CONCERNS OF CFD EMPLOYEES

Battalion Chief Shane Nantz addressed the Board. He explained he has been involved in multiple promotional processes under several fire chiefs. He provided an overview of his tenure with CFD. His concerns are about a personnel rule referred to as "Rule IX". In providing data about the promotion of minority candidates, he asserted the promotional system is not equitable.

Chairman McGill summarized the comments made by Battalion Chief Nantz by restating his assertion that the current CFD promotional system is not equitable across the board.

In response to a question, Battalion Chief Nantz recounted the issue associated with Rule IX dating back to 1998-1999.

Chairman McGill requested Battalion Chief Nantz provide a memo to the CSB with specifics about the changes he would like to see.

Battalion Chief expressed his appreciation for the opportunity to address the CSB.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to amend the agenda again to consider CMPD new hires before continuing with concerns of CFD employees.

CMPD RECRUITMENT AND TRAINING REPRESENTATIVES SERGEANT DAVID MILLER, LIEUTENANT CAVINESS AND CAPTAIN JULIE BARRY JOINED REMOTELY AT 4:30 PM.

Chairman McGill read the names of the CMPD candidates recommended for hire as members of Recruit Class #187 or a Lateral Class:

Ryan Dotter Avery
Adis Boric
Kyle Joseph Franks
Erik Daniel Henry
Rebecca Kathleen Stanton

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to subsection (a)(6) of NC General 143-318.11 to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of the prospective CMPD new hires.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:44 P.M. BY PAUSING THE REGULAR MEETING AND JOINING ANOTHER ELECTRONIC INVITATION. THE ATTENDANCE OF THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK AND CMPD REPRESENTATIVES WAS CONFIRMED.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:55 P.M.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD applicants recommended for hire.

CMPD representatives left the meeting at 4:56 P.M.

THE BOARD, BOARD ATTORNEY AND BOARD CLERK REJOINED THE MEETING TO CONTINUE WITH THE REMAINING PORTION OF THE MEETING IN OPEN SESSION.

Clerk Kelly spoke up to inform the Board that CFD Chief Johnson, Deputy Chief Winkles and CFD Human Resources Manager Kim Sanders were on the line earlier but were accidentally muted and therefore could not be heard.

CONCERNS OF CFD EMPLOYEES (Continued)

Tom Brewer, President, Charlotte Fire Fighters Association Local 660, addressed the board saying that all they are asking is that all the rules to be followed. He provided a historical justification for creation of civil service boards. Mr. Brewer stated that they don't believe all the rules are being followed and when they ask questions, they don't get answers. He insisted there is a lack of communication. He stated the Association has requested a legal written opinion of Rule IX on numerous occasions. He noted a legal review was provided in the last couple weeks, however, he stated it was not comprehensive. He raised questions about the recent Division Chief's promotional process. Regarding the Battalion Chief's process, there are concerns about possible inconsistencies which have not been addressed. Mr. Brewer noted there are issues and concerns with the Firefighter's II process as well. He mentioned discrepancies regarding "Informational Bulletins" (IBs) versus departmental policies or general orders. He noted that Rule IX allows for participants to challenge the test and that since the test, numerous inconsistencies have been raised.

Chairman McGill summarized Mr. Brewer's request for better communication with CFD leadership and to have the rules modified to allow the process to be fair for everyone.

Chief Reginald Johnson maintained that CFD does not treat CSB like a rubber stamp. He noted that Attorney Andrea Leslie-Fite prepared a legal review of Rule IX. He reminded the Board that efforts have been underway to overhaul the promotional process by obtaining a third-party vendor. One thing the vendor did provide is a survey after every process, prior to participants getting their grades. There was only 1% of the participants that thought the process was unfair. Chief Johnson stated he didn't agree with some of the remarks made by Battalion Chief Nantz and Captain Brewer during today's meeting and the timeline. Chief Johnson requested that Battalion Chief Nantz and Captain Brewer provide their complaints in writing so that CFD could respond.

Deputy Chief Jerry Winkles responded about the Fire Fighter II process. He explained that the Fire Fighter II process test is not a competitive test but a competency test. He explained that the test consists of competencies that are taught during recruit class. Deputy Chief Winkles provided a timeline of the testing process, based upon job performance competencies, from beginning, until the date of the test. He explained that participants were not presented new materials, but rather the job performance requirements; they did not add not anything. He provided a thorough explanation of the process and when participants received notification. Deputy Chief Winkles explained there were no written complaints received about the process. However, he explained there were two specific situations that CFD worked around because of individual circumstances in which they made accommodations.

Related to the Division Chief process, Deputy Chief Winkles explained that all the candidates had the opportunity to do a second review, as recommended by the vendor. He mentioned there was a problem with the random identification numbers used in the process, but upon an investigation, nothing was compromised before the scores were released. All the candidates were notified.

Attorney Andrea Leslie-Fite provided an overview of the memorandum drafted on May 21, 2020 from the City Attorney's Office regarding the CSB's role in promotions of Civil Service employees. She explained the CSB's authority as related to the Charlotte City Charter. She emphasized and noted the importance of the Board's role in promotions specifying that it is not only specified by City Charter but is also State law. She continued to provide an overview of the Board's role in overseeing examinations, noting that Board's role is clear as relates to applicants for initial hire for employment by CFD, but not so much for promotional examinations. Attorney Leslie-Fite went on to explain that Rule IX is an administrative rule that was adopted years ago. She noted that it would be appropriate for the Board to review in detail, but again reminded the Board that Rule IX is an administrative rule, but it is subservient with the City Charter and is not only local law but is State Law and therefore it prevails. Attorney Leslie-Fite stated the HR Task Force has been discussing and analyzing this issue and all City policies to maintain a level of consistency across the board, noting that the law has continued to evolve over the years.

Deputy Chief Winkles, in response to a question, noted there were eleven candidates that did not pass the Firefighter II Competency Test. He emphasized that the competencies were areas that were taught during recruit classes and basic requirements of the Firefighter I position. He further emphasized the eleven candidates are not among the list of names recommended for promotion to Fire Fighter II.

In response to a question, Deputy Chief Winkles stated the eleven candidates that did not pass the competency test this time would qualify to test again next year.

Deputy Chief Winkles reiterated that point that all the competencies presented on the competency test are taught during recruit school and are therefore part of the individual's job performance requirements.

Chairman McGill requested Deputy Chief Winkles provide the CSB with a copy of the results of CFD's investigation related to the random identification numbers.

Deputy Chief Winkles stated there have been no formal and/or written complaints about the FF II Promotions process from any of the candidates involved. He further explained that CFD has enlisted the assistance of CMPD Internal Affairs to conduct the investigation. Chairman McGill requested those results be shared with the CSB.

Attorney Leslie-Fite provided clarification that any employee or member of the public could notify CSB with any complaints about the process to be forwarded through the proper channels.

Deputy Chief Winkles noted that anyone that didn't feel comfortable communicating with CFD chain-of-command could communicate with HR, via the CFD HR Manager, Kim Sanders

Mr. Brewer stated the culture of fear within the CFD.

Mr. Brewer noted that employees are not comfortable speaking up thus they raise concerns to Local 660. He mentioned there is a culture of fear and intimidation that exists within CFD. He further noted that they never changed the policy but changed the process.

Chairman McGill requested that Mr. Brewer provide their requests and complaints to the Board in writing via the Clerk to the Board.

Chairman McGill read the names of the candidates recommended for promotions.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO FIREFIGHTER II:

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Ms. Millen and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO FIRE CAPTAIN:

Andrew Carter

Motion was made by Mrs. Hatch, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO BATTALION FIRE CHIEF:

Thomas Hildreth

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO DIVISION FIRE CHIEF:

Brandon Caputo

In response to a question, Deputy Chief Winkles noted that the Assessment Center consisted of the three CFD Deputy Chiefs and an outside assessor. He further noted the questions were developed by the third-party vendor to make sure the questions were suitable. He explained the process was purposeful to make sure the outside assessor began the grading process.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO ENGINEER:

John Jackson

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mrs. Hatch, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate recommended for promotion.

Deputy Chief Winkles provided demographics of those recommended for promotion as:
3 BM
3 Hispanic Males

1 Hispanic Female
26 White Males

POSSIBLE REVISIONS TO PROMOTIONAL MATERIALS

Mr. Young expressed a concern for additional information received on the recommendations for promotions from CMPD. He noted that it would be helpful to receive any citations, disciplinary actions, training, complaints, etc. There was a question of the Attorney as to whether or not this is information permissible to consider.

Attorney Leslie-Fite explained this request is within the Board's purview to ask for additional information to resolve whether the recommendation is appropriate. She further explained that nothing prohibits the CSB from asking for additional information, while cautioning that questions related to race, gender or sexual orientation would be inappropriate.

Mr. Young stated the additional information he would like to consider from CMPD such as citations, training, disciplinary actions, performance outcomes and complaints.

Attorney Leslie-Fite pointed out that requests for information should be consistent between CMPD and CFD.

Attorney Leslie-Fite recommended that in order to formalize the request, it would be good to incorporate this request to the Board's Rules and Procedures.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to write a memo to CFD and CMPD requesting additional information related to recommended promotions that include but are not limited to citations, training, disciplinary actions, complaints, commendations and complaints.

Mr. McCleary requested that CSB formally check in with Chief Johnny Jennings to provide a position and time frame for the results of an investigation into the incident of June 2, 2020 as requested by the Board on June 5, 2020.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Baldwin and carried unanimously to ask Attorney Leslie-Fite write a letter to CMPD's Attorney Jessica Battle seeking Chief Jennings position on the previous request from CSB for an investigation of the events of June 2, 2020.

There was conversation about the Board's position on responding to invitations to attend community rallies. Chairman McGill reiterated the Attorney's recommendation that the Board vote on such requests and that if the Board makes an appearance it would be to inform and educate about the Board's quasi-judicial and unbiased position.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to adjourn.

July 7, 2020
Minute Book 17, Page No. 234
Civil Service Board

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:28 P.M.

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Stephanie C. Kelly". The signature is written in black ink and is positioned above a horizontal line.

Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met by electronic platform on Tuesday, August 4, 2020 at 4:03 P.M. with Vice Chair Charlitta Hatch presiding. Board members attending remotely were: Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, David McCleary, Chairman Ryan McGill, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Ryon Smalls and Doug Young.

ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Andrea Leslie-Fite, Board Attorney and Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board

CALL TO ORDER: Vice Chair Hatch called the meeting to order at 4:03 PM and read the following statement: "Today's Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted electronically to support the essential services of the Police and Fire during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. All board members and City staff are asked to please identify themselves and be recognized by the Chair, so we make certain speakers are clearly identified for the minutes of this meeting."

APPROVE AGENDA:

Vice Chair Hatch requested approval of the agenda.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Vice Chair Hatch requested approval of minutes from the July 7, 2020 regular and closed session meetings.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of July 7, 2020 as submitted.
--

CMPD RECRUITMENT AND TRAINING REPRESENTATIVES SERGEANT DAVID MILLER, LIEUTENANT CAVINESS AND CAPTAIN JULIE BARRY JOINED THE MEETING REMOTELY AT 4:00 PM.

Mr. McCleary read the names of the CMPD candidates recommended for hire as members of Recruit Class #187 or a Lateral Class:

Timothy Lincoln Carr
Mary Katherine Grasta
Dylan Shane O'Dwyer
Dalton Edward Ray
Charles Andrew Sloop
Anthony John Weckenman

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to NC General Statute 143-318.11(a)(6) to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of a prospective CMPD new hire.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:13 P.M. BY PAUSING THE REGULAR MEETING AND JOINING ANOTHER ELECTRONIC INVITATION. THE ATTENDANCE OF THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK AND CMPD REPRESENTATIVES WAS CONFIRMED.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:23 P.M.

THE BOARD, BOARD ATTORNEY AND BOARD CLERK REJOINED THE MEETING TO CONTINUE WITH THE REMAINING PORTION OF THE MEETING IN OPEN SESSION.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to recuse Mr. McGill from voting on the applicants because he personally knows one of the applicants recommended for hire.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD applicants recommended for hire.

CMPD representatives left the meeting at 4:30 PM.

CFD REPRESENTATIVES CHIEF REGINALD JOHNSON, DEPUTY CHIEF JERRY WINKLES AND HR MANAGER KIM SANDERS JOINED THE MEETING REMOTELY.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTION TO FIREFIGHTER II:

Vice Chair Hatch read the name of the candidate recommended for promotion to Firefighter II:

Jordan Neely

Motion was made by Mr. McGill, seconded by Mr. McCleary, to approve the CFD candidate recommended for promotion.

OTHER BUSINESS

Ms. Kelly gave an update on the growing list of disciplinary hearings. She reported that the Government Center remains closed to the public so any hearings conducted will have to be virtual. At this point, no action has been taken to schedule a virtual hearing. Mrs. Leslie-Fite advised that even though the Board is equipped to proceed virtually, both sides must agree in order to proceed in that manner. An update will be provided at the September meeting.

Chairman McGill reference a recent letter sent to the Board from Tom Brewer, representing CFFA Local 660, requesting to appear before the Board again. Chairman McGill expressed uncertainty as to the groups' goal in having Mr. Brewer speak to the Board a second time. The Board asked if CFD would be willing to respond to CFFA Local 660's last letter so the Board can attempt to understand both sides. Chief Johnson stated CFD would provide a response to Mr. Brewer's most recent letter for the Board's September meeting.

Chairman McGill introduced attorneys Anthony Fox and Mac McCarley, with Parker Poe Adams & Bernstein, LLP, who have been hired by the City to review the promotional process. Mr. McCarley explained they were hired to look at the City Charter, CSB Rules of Procedures and Rule IX and the City's Personnel Guidelines to see if there is any discrepancies between the documents and actual practices. He stated they will report their findings to the HR Task Force; what the documents say, what they mean and whether they're being followed. A board member stated their hope that the findings of the investigation will provide clarity around many of the employee emails that have been forwarded to the Board.

A clarifying question was asked about the nature of the investigation; is it the CSB's role or specifically to address Mr. Brewer's complaints. Attorney McCarley explained the investigation is broader in scope...What is the Board's power, authority and role in the promotional process. He noted the investigation is not of the Board, but more of an analysis of the creating documents.

Chairman McGill suggested the Board delay bringing Mr. Brewer back until the findings of the investigation are complete and the Board has had an opportunity to review the responses provided by CFD.

Chairman McGill provided an overview of a newly formed task force created by the City Council Safe Communities Committee. The task force is called the "Community Input Group" and includes representation from various segments of the Charlotte community as well as the chairs of the Civil Service and Citizens Review Boards. This task force is being charged with review of CMPD policies and ways to enhance services. He noted that suggestions and opinions from the group vary but pointed out one suggestion that has surfaced from the Safe Coalition is that the Civil Service Board serve as a appellant group to citizens who are not pleased with the outcome of their appeal to the Citizens Review Board. Because the CSB already has the authority to request the chiefs do an investigation of an officer or firefighter that is of interest to the public, this could be another avenue for adjudication of citizens' appeals about conduct of police officers. Attorney Leslie-Fite noted the process would need to be carefully vetted in order to make sure what's being described is within the Board's scope.

A question was raised about obtaining support for such a change to the City Charter from the North Carolina General Assembly. Concern was expressed that meetings of the Community Input Group are not assessible to the public. Mr. McGill explained that all meetings of the group are open, however, meetings are conducted under the Chatham House Rule, which allows members of the group to participate and voice opinions while not being identified.

Mr. McCleary questioned whether there has been a response from Chief Jennings regarding the Board's request for an investigation into the Uptown event of June 2, 2020. Chairman McGill responded that Chief Jennings has agreed to follow through on the request.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Clements to amend the agenda in order to discuss giving CMPD a deadline by which to provide the results of an investigation regarding the events in Uptown on the evening of June 2, 2020.

Attorney Leslie-Fite explained it is within the Board's purview to request the investigation be conducted within a specified period of time and that this may be the first time this provision of the Civil Service Board authority has been exercised.

After discussion, the motion was carried by a unanimous vote of those on the electronic format. Ms. Millen and Mr. Young both lost connection to the meeting.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously among those on the electronic format to request CMPD provide the results of their investigation into the June 2, 2020 Uptown events at the September 1, 2020 meeting. Ms. Millen, Mr. Young and Ms. Reynolds lost connection to the meeting.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to adjourn.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:00 P.M.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board

September 1, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met by electronic platform on Monday, September 1, 2020 at 4:00 P.M. with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members attending remotely were: Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, David McCleary, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Ryon Smalls and Doug Young.

ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Andrea Leslie-Fite, Board Attorney; Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board; Stephanie Bello, Deputy City Clerk; and Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board

CALL TO ORDER:

Chairman McGill called the meeting to order at 4:02 PM and read the following statement: “Today’s Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted electronically to support the essential services of the Police and Fire during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. All board members and City staff are asked to please identify themselves and be recognized by the Chair, so we make certain speakers are clearly identified for the minutes of this meeting.”

Board members introduced themselves and welcomed Kirk McSwain as the new Assistant Clerk to the Board.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Mr. McCleary proposed an amendment to the agenda moving item number four, “Consider CMPD New Hires” to follow agenda item number five, “CMPD Update on Investigation”. Chairman McGill further proposed that the first item under Other Business, “Update on Disciplinary Hearings” be merged into the “CMPD Update on Investigation” agenda item.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to amend the discussion order of items and approve the agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Chairman McGill requested approval of minutes from the August 4, 2020 regular and closed session meetings.

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of August 4, 2020 as submitted.

DEPUTY CHIEF OF POLICE ESTELLA PATTERSON JOINED THE MEETING REMOTELY AT 4:08 P.M.

September 1, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

CMPD UPDATE ON INVESTIGATION:

Deputy Chief Patterson sat as the Chairperson of the Independent Chain of Command Review Board Hearing regarding two excessive force allegations brought forth against the Charlotte Mecklenburg Police Department. The hearing concerned two alleged violations of the CMPD Rules of Conduct:

(A) Rule of Conduct 28A - Use of Force

“Officers will use no more force than necessary in the performance of their duties and will then do so only in accordance with CMPD procedures and the law.”

Allegation concerned the use of Riot Control Agents (RCA) to disperse crowds without providing an avenue of escape.

(B) Rule of Conduct 2 - Violation of Rules

“Employees will not commit any acts or make any omissions, which constitute a violation of any of the rules, policies, procedures, or other directives of CMPD.”

Allegation was that the CMPD did not follow the Civil Emergency Unit policy and procedures in the deployment of RCAs.

Deputy Chief Patterson stated that the full investigation included sixteen interviews with officers involved in the incident in question, nine interviews with civilian complainants, the Chief of Police, and the Deputy Chief who was the Incident Commander that night.

Deputy Chief Patterson then described the events of the night of June 2nd as they were provided to the Review Board. She stated that earlier in the day, the NAACP hosted a peaceful protest that did not result in any incidents and after which the majority of participants dispersed at around 7:00 p.m. Those who remained, along with other crowds who joined, had congregated at 7th and College Street around 8:45 p.m. At that point, the tone of the protest had changed to more riotous behavior, including thrown objects, malicious use of lasers, and damage to vehicles, causing the CMPD to declare the gathering as an unlawful assembly. At 9:04, officers reported that they had been sprayed with chemical irritants by the crowd, leading CMPD to issue dispersal orders and deploy RCA sprays and OC gas to disperse the crowd.

Deputy Chief Patterson then went on to describe the various movements of the crowd down various City streets and CMPD’s effort to guide the direction of those movements. The Deputy Chief described how the crowd ultimately became isolated between two lines of police officers, both deploying RCAs. This tactic is taught by the Center for Domestic Preparedness and is part of CMPD training and procedures. Part of this training includes the identification of points of egress, or escape, of which two points were identified at the time of the incident.

While Deputy Chief Patterson acknowledged that the way in which the incident unfolded left many in the crowd confused and unaware of which direction that they should go, the Review Board concluded that the actions by the police in that particular circumstance were justified. Accordingly, the police officers involved in the incident were exonerated. This decision was determined largely due to the fact that two egress points were identified prior to RCAs being deployed as well as evidence of members of the crowd successfully using those avenues of escape.

September 1, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Deputy Chief Patterson concluded by stating that the Department's policies have been reviewed and changed as a result of the incident. This includes no longer using corralling as a technique in controlling crowds as well as equipping all civil emergency personnel with body cameras. Deputy Chief Patterson also stated that the incident related to a certain sergeant's comments is a pending case that will likely be reviewed by the Civil Service Board in a future meeting.

The Board proceeded to ask questions concerning the discussed incidents. Mr. Baldwin asked whether the terminology, "kettling" came up during their review. Deputy Chief Patterson responded that "kettling" and "corralling" are interchangeable terms and that the tactic is commonly used in law enforcement and endorsed by the Center for Domestic Preparedness. She stated that the department recognizes that the optics are not good and that they will no longer employ such tactics.

Mr. Young asked about the use of RCAs at various locations across the city and the objective of using those RCAs at those various points and times. Deputy Chief Patterson responded by saying that as the crowd moved around, the intent of each use of RCAs was to encourage dispersal of the crowd. Mr. Young followed up asking specifically about the use of RCAs by the BB&T building and the Bank of America parking garage. Deputy Chief Patterson replied that the officers placed on the second floor of the parking garage were there for the purpose of stopping property damage. She stated that the officers there misinterpreted the actions of the crowd attempting to move under the gate as instead trying to damage said gate and responded by firing pepper balls above the heads of those in the crowd with the intent of the RCAs coming down on top of those in the crowd, therefore encouraging dispersal.

Mr. McCleary asked whether the SBI report of June 12 was considered in the internal affairs investigation – Deputy Chief Patterson confirmed that it was considered. Mr. McCleary asked a follow-up question whether the SBI was updated after the court authorized the release of body-worn camera (BWC) footage and if the investigation considered all relevant BWC footage of the incident. Deputy Chief Patterson responded that all relevant BWC footage was considered along with all pertinent street and helicopter video. Mr. McCleary's last question was whether the updated IAA findings would be provided to the Civil Service Board. Deputy Chief Patterson replied that they will get those materials to the CSB.

Mr. Smalls asked if the SOP is being updated with new guidance for officers on the ground for what to do in similar situations and how many officers should be deployed in one specific area in order to disperse a crowd. Deputy Chief Patterson responded that those updates have already been made to those policies, including dispersal orders prior to deploying RCAs, more clearly identifying egress points, as well as continual review of those policies for necessary changes. Mr. Smalls then asked for clarification on whether or not the policy dictates the use of specific RCAs in a given situation. Deputy Chief Patterson responded by stating that an independent assessment of the situation must be determined and relayed to the Commander in charge of that unit. She said that the policy is not specific about the quantity of RCAs in a given situation as it is dependent on those particular circumstances.

Hearing no further questions, Chairman McGill asked the Deputy Chief for any last comments. She responded that the Chief said it best when describing that the situation didn't look good and that they as a department will be using the experience as a learning moment to continually improve their policies and procedures so that a similar incident does not occur.

September 1, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Chairman McGill then asked to hear from Attorney Battle regarding disciplinary hearings. Board Attorney Fite responded that many of the matters involved concern confidential personnel issues and that it might be advantageous to share updates with the board via letter instead of discussion in open session.

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES

Chairman McGill read the names of the CMPD candidates recommended for hire as members of Recruit Class # 187 or a Lateral Class:

Scott Joseph Baglia	Cameron Lane Hodges
Shaun Michael Baras	Peterson Jean
Talayna Shireese Coleman	Zachary Davis Johnson
John Michael Collins	Ryan Christopher Jones
Reilly Joseph Delk	Ryan Edward Lynch
Miranda Luise Dougherty	Jacob Bowie Morris
Darrion Lamont Eichelberger	Taydan Michael Jimboy Musser
Connor Michael Fayle	Robert Conner Neal
Isaac John Fleming	Alexa Carol Odom
Richard Jonvarous Gladden	Anthony Joseph Roman
Anasterasia Nicole Gose	Cameron Lee Steeley
John Ross Hammond	Xao Thao
Evan Michael Henken-Seifken	Marcus Jerome Walker
Blaine Alexander Hill	Craig Austin Warren

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Ms. Millen , and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to NC General Statute 143-318.11(a)(6) to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of a prospective CMPD new hire.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:40 P.M. BY PAUSING THE REGULAR MEETING AND JOINING ANOTHER ELECTRONIC INVITATION. THE ATTENDANCE OF THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK, THE ASSISTANT CLERK, THE DEPUTY CITY CLERK, AND CMPD REPRESENTATIVES WAS CONFIRMED.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:54 P.M.

THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK, THE ASSISTANT CLERK, AND THE DEPUTY CITY CLERK REJOINED THE MEETING TO CONTINUE WITH THE REMAINING PORTION OF THE MEETING IN OPEN SESSION.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD applicants recommended for hire.

September 1, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Mr. Young asked the Board for a status update on the Board's unanimous request for additional information from CMPD and CFD when considering promotions. Clerk Kelly responded that CMPD had not yet had promotions to consider in order to implement the requested change in procedure while the CFD has incorporated that request into the candidates they put forth for consideration. Clerk Kelly stated, however, that no formal response was requested from either Department but will do so.

Chairman McGill then went on to ask Sergeant Miller, the Board generally, and Board Attorney Fite, whether or not the CSB in their current capacity has the option to require that applicants submit documentation of any tattoos they might have. Board Attorney Fite responded that adjusting requirements for application for all candidates is within their purview but would need to research further the case law regarding photography and a tattoo requirement. Chairman McGill requested that Clerk Kelly follow-up with CMPD regarding their opinion on the issue.

Mr. Clements asked the Board how broad of an inquiry into tattoos they would be asking and if non-visible tattoos would also be considered. Chairman McGill noted that in the military, all tattoos are documented without exception. Mr. Clements stated that, pending legal advice, following the same standard would be fair.

CONSIDER CFD NEW HIRES

Mr. Clements read the names of the CMPD candidates recommended for hire as members of Recruit Class #114 or a Lateral Class

William Adams	Eric Frasure	Ian McClusky
Hunter Allen	Christopher Friel	Brandon Montesi
Christopher Anselmo	Matthew Gaine	Reginald Pharr, Jr.
Gabriel Lopez Azamar	John Gammons	Jacob Potter
Samuel Baker	Daniel Graser	Jonathan Reed
Justin Blatnik	Reyes Cruz Guzman	Zachary Ricketts
Jemel Mann Brown	Kyle Haldeman	Christin Robinson
Bryant Bullock	Michael Holton	Steven Salvatore
Rebecca Cato	Aaron Hoover	Nelson Santos, Jr.
Ronald Cole	Demario House	Benjamin Scott
William Costello III	Devin Huffman	Joshua Sheffield
Dantonio Crandell	Tyler Johnson	Kalmon Stokes
Charles Dennis II	Matthew Kirichun	Ozell Thompson III
Tristian Duckwall	Paul Krahe	Matthew Tonnies
Allie Edwards	Jacob Lawrence	Devan Watts
Michael Forte	Talor Lee	Grant White

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD applicants recommended for hire.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTION TO FIREFIGHTER ENGINEER

September 1, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Kevin Walling

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTION TO FIREFIGHTER CAPTAIN

Jalen Arnold

Amanda Leigh

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to NC General Statute 143-318.11(a)(6) to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of a prospective CFD candidates for promotion.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 5:06 P.M. BY PAUSING THE REGULAR MEETING AND JOINING ANOTHER ELECTRONIC INVITATION. THE ATTENDANCE OF THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK, THE ASSISTANT CLERK, THE DEPUTY CITY CLERK, AND CFD REPRESENTATIVES WAS CONFIRMED.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 5:25 P.M.

THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK, THE ASSISTANT CLERK, THE DEPUTY CITY CLERK, AND CHIEF WINKLES REJOINED THE MEETING TO CONTINUE WITH THE REMAINING PORTION OF THE MEETING IN OPEN SESSION.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate recommended for promotion to Firefighter Engineer.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion to Firefighter Captain.

Chief Winkles stated the demographics of Recruit Class #114, an all EMT class, had a diversity of 17% with: one white female, one black male, one Hispanic male, one black female, and the remainder of the class being white males. Recruit Class #115 had a diversity of 42% with one white female, one Hispanic male, eight black males, and the remainder of the class being white males. The overall diversity of the two classes being hired together is 29%. In terms of promotion, the Firefighter Engineer promoted was a white male and the Firefighter Captains promoted were one white female and one black male.

OTHER BUSINESS

Discussion of CFD Response to Letter from CFFA Local 660 (All)

Discussion of CFD Response to Letter from Battalion Chief Shane Nantz (All)

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to NC General Statute 143-318.11(a)(6) to review the response to grievances put forward by an employee.

September 1, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 5:30 P.M. BY PAUSING THE REGULAR MEETING AND JOINING ANOTHER ELECTRONIC INVITATION. THE ATTENDANCE OF THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK, THE ASSISTANT CLERK, THE DEPUTY CITY CLERK, AND CFD REPRESENTATIVES WAS CONFIRMED.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 6:03 P.M.

THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK, THE ASSISTANT CLERK, THE DEPUTY CITY CLERK, CHIEF WINKLES, AND CHIEF JOHNSON REJOINED THE MEETING TO CONTINUE WITH THE REMAINING PORTION OF THE MEETING IN OPEN SESSION.

Update on Disciplinary Hearings

City Clerk Kelly stated that there are a total of eleven outstanding hearings, eight of which concern CMPD and three regarding CFD. Board Attorney Fite relayed her conversations with the CMPD and CFD attorneys concerning their openness to the idea of virtual disciplinary hearings on a case-by-case basis but noted that, legally, virtual disciplinary hearings can only be conducted upon the consent of all parties involved, including both the officer making the appeal as well as the Department involved. Further, she stated that if consent can be gathered for involved parties, they plan to move forward with hearings chronologically starting from the oldest outstanding hearing. Chairman McGill asked that October 28th and 29th be reserved as a potential time to hold hearings.

McGill concluded this portion of the meeting by discussing the email by Robert Dawkins asking that the CSB be able to, by consent of the City Council, employ the language put forth by the General Assembly that grants the Civil Service Board its penal power and to add an additional duty to work as an appellate-type board. Board Attorney Fite noted that while the City Council can alter the CSB charter in accordance with the proposed changes, ultimately, no matter what decision is reached, it must fall within the bounds put forth in law by the General Assembly.

Ms. Millen asked whether or not Chairman McGill had spoken on behalf of CSB regarding these changes to which Chairman McGill noted that he had not. Ms. Millen followed-up by asking if he had spoken as an individual regarding these changes to which Chairman McGill responded that he had advocated regarding the tattoo issue as well as telling Mr. Dawkins that he liked the idea of the proposed changes.

Ms. Millen then addressed the subpoena power being requested to note that its primary value lies in its ability to subpoena citizens or witnesses, not necessarily the officers involved. She then asked what would these changes accomplish that is not fulfilled by the courts. Chairman McGill opined that it gives citizens more opportunity to access civilian oversight. Ms. Millen concluded by suggesting to the board that they should consider giving official input to the City Council. Ms. Hatch affirmed her support of the changes and Mr. Baldwin asked if the City Council is expecting input. Chairman McGill responded that they had not officially asked. Mr. Young noted that he believed that it was premature to provide input at this point in time and Mr. McCleary agreed.

Before the Board moved to adjourn, City Clerk Kelly noted that CMPD had just provided CSB via email the demographics of the new hires: seventeen white males, two white females, five black males, two black females, one Indian male, and one Asian-American male. She also noted that they plan to discuss the

September 1, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

tattoo issue and note that they currently ask applicants to describe their tattoos, where they are placed on their bodies, and what the tattoo means. Chairman McGill asked that they discuss the issue at the October meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no further discussion, Chairman McGill asked for a motion to adjourn.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to adjourn.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:18 P.M.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board



Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board

October 6, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met by electronic platform on Tuesday, October 6, 2020 at 4:00 P.M. with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members attending remotely were: Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Ryon Smalls, and Doug Young.

ABSENT: David McCleary

ALSO PRESENT: Lina James, Interim Board Attorney; Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board; and Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board

CALL TO ORDER:

Chairman McGill called the meeting to order at 4:04 PM and read the following statement: “Today’s Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted virtually in accordance with the electronic meeting statute to support the essential services of the Police and Fire during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. All board members and City staff are asked to please identify themselves and be recognized by the Chair, so we make certain speakers are clearly identified for the minutes of this meeting.”

APPROVE AGENDA:

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the amended agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of September 1, 2020 as submitted.

ROBERT DAWKINS, STATE ORGANIZER OF SAFE COALITION NC, AND JESSICA BATTLE, LEAD SENIOR ASSISTANT CITY ATTORNEY, JOINED THE MEETING REMOTELY AT 4:08 P.M.

DISCUSSION ON SAFE COALITIONS RECOMMENDATION:

Robert Dawkins thanked the Board for his invitation to speak to them about SAFE Coalition NC’s ambition to make police accountability as much in the hands of the community as possible. To that end, Mr. Dawkins began the discussion by stating that Charlotte, unlike many cities, has already established both a Citizens Review Board (CRB) and a Civil Service Board (CSB) and discussed the challenges which that represents as well as how they can structurally improve those boards to improve police accountability. Mr. Dawkins’ proposal was that the Citizens Review Board should maintain its current powers and mission in regard to hearings but alter its procedure after reaching a sustained decision by turning those cases over to the Civil Service Board for further investigation rather than providing a recommendation to CMPD’s internal affairs. General Assembly research concluded that there are no state statutes prohibiting the adoption of this proposal.

October 6, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Attorney Jessica Battle discussed the feasibility of the proposal and the steps necessary to initiate such a change. She stated that the charters of both CSB and CRB would need to be rewritten as well as city ordinances as the purview given to each board does not provide for an intersection of their duties. Attorney Battle further stated that a change to the appeals process implicates the rights of officers and that therefore the position of CMPD is that the Boards keep their roles and duties distinct and separate from one another.

Ms. Hatch asked Attorney Battle if the proposal provides a good opportunity to review the charters of both boards for what is best for the City in the current day rather than when it was written. While Attorney Battle agreed that it is good to review the charters for that reason, she stated that the internal / external distinction between the two boards in their charters is valuable even if the original intent of the charters could be reconsidered. Chair McGill mentioned a previous discussion about expanding the size of the CSB from eight to eleven so that those three new members could hear CRB appeals while leaving the previous eight to remain neutral for related CSB hearings. Attorney Battle agreed that whatever the final decision is, keeping a separate group would be necessary to prevent any conflicts of interest.

Ms. Millen asked, were they to go the route of the proposal, who would issue subpoenas and how would that affect the parties involved. Clerk Kelly replied that it is the City Clerk's Office that issues subpoenas on behalf of the Board. Chair McGill then, for the sake of discussion, stated the purpose of the vote before the board was only a recommendation to City Council and that ultimately it will be City Council who will decide if and how it is implemented.

Mr. Baldwin asked for clarification on when subpoenas would actually need to be issued and how the proposal being discussed would change the role of the Board. Mr. Dawkins replied that the proposal being considered avoids certain pitfalls that granting CRB subpoena, investigatory, and decision-making powers might cause. The reasoning being that it allows the officer to first be investigated in-house by internal affairs, the CRB can investigate whether the Chief of Police erred in their decision, and then, if they sustain the decision that the Chief of Police erred, the case would go to the CSB rather than returning to CMPD where further action is unlikely to take place. The alternative option of simply giving the CRB those aforementioned powers is unlikely due to the barriers presented by seeking authorization from the General Assembly. A final option that could be brought to the City Manager is dissolving both boards and creating an independent office of police accountability – though this too would require action by the General Assembly. It is his belief that one of the three options will ultimately need to be chosen by the City. Attorney Battle reiterated the importance of keeping the boards distinct from one another in order to avoid conflicts of interest and the potential legal battles which that lack of distinction might create. She further noted that the Chief of Police is in favor of granting subpoena powers to the Citizens Review Board but only if that power can be applied to both officers and citizens, not one or the other. She also noted that the CRB is not the only avenue of legal recourse for complainants not satisfied with Internal Affairs.

Ms. Reynolds asked that were the CRB given the power to subpoena, would that change an officer's ability to bring an attorney to those hearings and if she is correct that officers cannot currently bring an attorney to a CRB hearing. Attorney Battle stated that though their attorney is often close by, the officer still has the right to remain silent before the board. Clerk Kelly further clarified the two-part CRB process. The initial hearing is held without the officer present and separately hears from the complainant and the sergeant who conducted the Internal Affairs investigation. The board then considers what both sides reported and decides whether they need additional information. If they do decide that they need additional information, they will then hold an evidentiary hearing. At an evidentiary hearing, both the complainant and the officer have the right to have an attorney present, both will present sworn testimony, and a court reporter is present.

October 6, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Ms. Millen asked Clerk Kelly how many times an officer had not appeared before the CRB in all of their cases. Ms. Kelly stated that, while she cannot speak for the entire twenty-three-year history of the board, in her sixteen-year experience with the CRB she could recall only one incidence where an officer did not appear. Ms. Millen stated that in her nine and half year experience on the Citizens Review Board she never experienced an officer not appearing but recalled many examples of when witnesses for the complainant would not appear at the hearing. For that reason, Ms. Millen opined that further consideration should be given to that matter and related unknowns before the CSB decides whether or not the proposal at hand is worthy of consideration. In response, Chair McGill reiterated that the ultimate decision is City Council's and that the Council's wish is to know CSB's thoughts on the matter. He further suggested that the board vote only on if they are in favor of having the City Attorneys explore the course of action and if the CSB is open to further discussion on the matter.

Tom Baldwin asked for clarification concerning the statement from SAFE Coalition NC about adding an additional role for the CSB and if that will be a part of the recommendation that CSB is voting on. Mr. Dawkins confirmed that is an element of the proposal and Chair McGill confirmed that is a part of the recommendation being voted on. Hearing no further discussion, Chair McGill stated that he would entertain a motion for a vote.

Motion was made by Mr. Smalls, seconded by Mr. Clements, to support the SAFE Coalition NC recommendation to City Council to expand the role of the Civil Service Board to act as an appellate body for claims coming from the Citizens Review Board. The motion passed with a vote of five (5) to three (3) Ayes: Clements, Hatch, McGill, Smalls, Young and Nays: Baldwin, Millen and Reynolds.

FOLLOW-UP ON CMPD RECRUITING (TATTOOS):

Kamella Emmanuel, CMPD Human Resources Manager, spoke to the Board about CMPD's policies concerning tattoos. While they cannot, and do not take or request, photographs of candidate tattoos, they do require that all tattoos over the size of two inches be covered while on duty. The appropriateness of a given tattoo is covered and evaluated under the grooming standards of their policy.

Sergeant David Miller described the questionnaire given during the application process which includes a section asking candidates if they have any tattoos, how many that they have, and the meaning and location of those tattoos. In the past, they have asked candidates to provide photographs or request to look at visible tattoos which, according to the given description, might potentially violate CMPD policy and therefore give them a reason to inquire. As a general practice, they have no right to ask for photographs or ask that a candidate remove clothes at any point in order to evaluate any non-visible tattoos.

Attorney Jessica Battle further clarified that the reason that they have not created a policy which would ask for photographs of tattoos, in addition to privacy concerns, is that such a policy might be grounds for discrimination claims as a photograph of a tattoo would also include that candidate's skin color and therefore could argue was used against them in an employment decision relative to another candidate who might have a similar tattoo and did not receive that adverse employment action.

Chair McGill asked if the policy highlights which tattoos would be inappropriate. Ms. Emmanuel stated that tattoos and their explanation is one aspect of many which are considered when evaluating the background of an applicant being moved forward for consideration. Major Jacquelyn Bryley further

October 6, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

clarified that if, for example, an offensive tattoo that was not disclosed was witnessed during the academy by a fellow candidate in the locker-room, that information would be forwarded to the recruitment staff and documented.

Ryon Smalls asked if the grooming policy defines what sort of tattoos would be considered extremist, indecent, sexist, or racist. Major Bryley replies that the policy states what is deemed offensive by reasonable standards but would have to review the policy to be more specific about the wording included. Attorney Battle read from the policy which stated that visible tattoos and brands “cannot be vulgar, indecent, sexist, or racist in content or nature.” She further stated that there are no individual definitions of those categories in the policy. Mr. Baldwin asked that if a tattoo is found to be in violation of that policy can that officer be terminated. Ms. Emmanuel confirmed that they could potentially be terminated after a review of the violation by Internal Affairs.

Mr. Clements asked for clarification concerning if the crossroads of better protection of citizens is more so with the first amendment rights of the police officer than it is a matter of CMPD policy. Ms. Emmanuel replied that officers agree to CMPD policies when they accept the position and that CMPD can uphold those policies. Attorney Battle further clarified that the CMPD policy primarily discusses visible tattoos as certain off-color non-visible tattoos can fall into certain first-amendment protections of personal expression, but that a racist or discriminatory non-visible tattoo would always be considered as disqualifying or prohibited. Ms. Emmanuel also stated that even though the policy and ADA compliance does not allow the department to require the removal of clothes to document tattoos, the fact that an officer did not disclose a tattoo would be considered as lying on their application and be grounds for dismissal.

FOLLOW-UP ON 2019 HEARING:

Attorney Battle summarized to the Board that Mr. Marin was cited for termination in 2019 for non-performance of law and other matters related to a domestic violence dispute that occurred. The Board upheld the termination but suspended it for a year so long as he did not violate any laws or policies. As of September 15, 2020, the State of North Carolina Department of Justice suspended his law enforcement certification for five years for assaulting a female as well as a five-year suspension for injury to property – the suspensions will run concurrently. He has the right to appeal the decision for up to thirty days from the receipt of the letter postmarked on the 15th. Attorney Battle will update the Board when it is known whether or not he has chosen to pursue an appeal.

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES:

Chairman McGill read the names of the CMPD candidates recommended for hire as members of Recruit Class # 187 or a Lateral Class:

Manuel Oscar Santos Abrina	Tyler Briscoe	Joseph Derrick Coram
Brian Charles Dolce	Anthony Laron Dunlap	Dylan Christopher Finley
Alexander George Flores	Sierra Nicole Fordham	Blake Phillip Goodin
D'Andre Marquez Harris	Joshua Paul Heater	Stephen Frandlin Heeseman
Ross Hudson	Shawn Johnstone	Jack Hardy Jones II
Alexander Ryan Kelly	Joseph Lynch	Stephanie Michalowski
Cameron Mongkonthavone	Breanna Renee Moore	Glenn Navarro

October 6, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Lance Leon Obadiaru	Joseph McKim Pharr	Christopher Ashley Pike
Cameron James Rider	Joseph Russo	Avery John Ryan
Nicholas Francis Tarantino	Stephen Holt Tockey	Samuel Wimbrow

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to NC General Statute 143-318.11(a)(6) to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of a prospective CMPD new hire.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 5:01 P.M. BY PAUSING THE REGULAR MEETING AND JOINING ANOTHER ELECTRONIC INVITATION. THE ATTENDANCE OF THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK, THE ASSISTANT CLERK, AND CMPD REPRESENTATIVES WAS CONFIRMED.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 5:19 P.M.

THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK, THE ASSISTANT CLERK, AND CMPD REPRESENTATIVES REJOINED THE MEETING TO CONTINUE WITH THE REMAINING PORTION OF THE MEETING IN OPEN SESSION.

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD applicants recommended for hire.

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTION TO RANK OF DEPUTY CHIEF:

Steven Brochu	Sherie Pearsall
---------------	-----------------

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTION TO RANK OF MAJOR:

Jacquelyn Hulsey	Melanie Peacock
------------------	-----------------

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTION TO RANK OF CAPTAIN:

Michael Anderson	Micahel Ford
------------------	--------------

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTION TO RANK OF LIEUTENANT:

Richard Beam	Jeffrey Brown
David Georgion	David Miller
Richard Nelson	Ericka Ojanit
Joseph Reiner	Jeffrey Wheaton

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTION TO RANK OF SERGEANT:

Katie Anderson	Calvin Belle	Charlie Davis
Sean Healy	Anthony Holzhauser	Brandy Lingle

October 6, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Joshua Phillips	Christopher Roseboro	Kris Skelly
Justin Spindler	Casey Xiong	

Ms. Millen asked how a violation or suspension affects eligibility for promotion as it relates to the waiting period. CMPD Assistant HR Manager Robert Lucas replied that it is a two year waiting period from the point of adjudication.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS TO FIRE CAPTAIN:

Walter Love II

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion to Firefighter Captain. Ms. Hatch abstained as she stepped away during the vote.

2020 CFD ENGINEER'S PROMOTIONAL PROCESS REPORT:

Chief Winkles stated that he had shared the report in advance of the CSB meeting and would give a brief summary. Forty-four Firefighter IIs participated for an overall 97.8% participation rate. The average rating was 4.56 out of 5 on a scale of strongly disagree to strongly agree across assessment areas, including skill assessments, job performance requirements, engineer job description, information provided during field test, and time and materials to perform assessment. Feedback statements were including in their entirety in the report. He also stated that they have had a lot of positive feedback in the field as well.

OTHER BUSINESS

Update on Hearings

Clerk Kelly gave the update and proposed a “rather aggressive approach to tackling the hearings”. She stated that there are a total of ten hearings in the queue, eight for CMPD and two for CFD, with the oldest dating back to 2017 due to pending criminal charges. Of the eight for CMPD, one is an appeal of a suspension while the others are for termination. She noted that an appeal of a suspension requires only three board members for a hearing while a termination requires five. The CFD has one suspension appeal and one citation for termination.

Clerk Kelly identified the Solid Waste Services Building, located at 1105 Otts Street, as an alternative location to hold hearings. The hearings will be socially distanced, require masks when not eating, and there will be a temperature check before entering the building. She proposed that the first hearing be held on October 28th if possible and that the November hearings be held on the 18th and 19th following Chair McGill’s suggestion. For December, she proposed the 16th and 17th as hearing dates with a possible additional date on December 1st. She requested feedback on these calendars via email.

November Meeting Date

October 6, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Clerk Kelly suggested that they move the regularly scheduled board meeting of November from Tuesday, November 3rd to Wednesday, November 4th to accommodate Election Day. A consensus was reached by voice that the next regularly scheduled meeting will be held on November 4th.

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no further discussion, Chairman McGill asked for a motion to adjourn.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Smalls, and carried unanimously to adjourn.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:44 P.M.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board



Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board

November 4, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met by electronic platform on Wednesday, November 4, 2020 at 4:00 P.M. with member Tom Baldwin presiding. Board members attending remotely were: Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, David McCleary, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Ryon Smalls, and Doug Young.

ABSENT: Vice Chair Charlitta Hatch and Chairman Ryan McGill

ALSO PRESENT: Lina James, Interim Board Attorney; Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board; Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board; and Jill Sanchez-Myers, Board Attorney

CALL TO ORDER:

Mr. Baldwin stated that Chair McGill asked that he preside over the meeting due to Mr. McGill's military obligations. Mr. Baldwin called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM and read the following statement: "Today's Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted virtually in accordance with the electronic meeting statute to support the essential services of the Police and Fire during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. All board members and City staff are asked to please identify themselves and be recognized by the Chair, so we make certain speakers are clearly identified for the minutes of this meeting."

Clerk Stephanie Kelly introduced Jill Sanchez-Myers, the new Board Attorney, to the Board. Attorney Sanchez-Myers introduced herself and each Board Member took a turn introducing themselves in return.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of October 6, 2020 as submitted.

ROBERT LUCAS, CMPD DEPUTY HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGER, JOINED THE MEETING REMOTELY AT 4:06 P.M.

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTION TO RANK OF SERGEANT:

Jared Whitner

Mr. Baldwin asked the CMPD HR Manager, Robert Lucas, to briefly discuss the candidate for promotion. Mr. Lucas stated that Officer Jared Whitner has been with CMPD for nearly fourteen years, had an "exceptional" rating on his last performance evaluation, and an "exceeded" rating on his year two performance evaluation. He has been with the Westover Division since being sworn in as an officer, received his bachelor's degree from the Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, and has not had any disciplinary actions against him for the past two years.

November 4, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Hearing no questions, Mr. Baldwin stated that he would entertain a motion for approval.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidate recommended for promotion.

Before moving on to other business, Ms. Millen asked Mr. Lucas if, by consent of the board, could the board request CMPD provide five years of disciplinary action history instead of two. Mr. Lucas and CMPD Human Resources Manager Kamella Emmanuel asked Ms. Millen to clarify the reason for the request. Ms. Millen reiterated her belief in the value of further information in determining which officers are best suited for a leadership position.

Ms. Emmanuel then briefly discussed the barriers which increasing the promotional process length might present. Ms. Millen and Mr. McCleary both suggested that additional information supplied by CMPD would not be overly onerous and therefore do not understand the objection. After further discussion, board members and CMPD came to the understanding that the request made by the board was not in regard to the internal CMPD promotion evaluation process or CMPD HR policies, but rather the information that is sent to the board prior to CSB's role in the promotional process. Accordingly, CMPD agreed to submit a five-year history of any disciplinary actions for any future candidate brought forward to the board for consideration.

OTHER BUSINESS

Update on Hearings

Clerk Kelly gave an update on the hearing schedule and those dates which are still tentative. The November 19th, 2020, hearing was confirmed with Mr. Baldwin, Mr. McGill, Mr. Smalls, Ms. Reynolds, and Mr. Clements serving. The hearing will be held at the Solid Waste Services Building, located at 1105 Otts Street, starting at 8:30 a.m. COVID-19 precautions, such as social-distancing, temperature checks, and mask requirements, will be present as well as boxed lunches and snacks.

Clerk Kelly then surveyed the board on availability for tentative hearings scheduled December 1st and 2nd and stated those who had already volunteered.

The hearing on December 16th and 17th was confirmed with Mr. Young, Mr. Baldwin, Mr. Smalls, Ms. Reynolds, Mr. Clements, Ms. Hatch, and Ms. Millen all volunteering. As the number of volunteers exceeds that which is required, Clerk Kelly will confirm those members which are selected for that hearing at a later date.

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no further discussion, Mr. Baldwin asked for a motion to adjourn.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to adjourn.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:26 P.M.

November 4, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board



Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board

December 1, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met by electronic platform on Tuesday, December 1, 2020 at 4:00 P.M. with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members attending remotely were: Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, Ryan McGill, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Ryon Smalls, and Doug Young.

ABSENT: David McCleary

ALSO PRESENT: Lina James, City Attorney; Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board; Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board; and Jill Sanchez-Myers, Board Attorney

CALL TO ORDER:

Chair McGill called the meeting to order at 4:02 PM and read the following statement: “Today’s Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted virtually in accordance with the electronic meeting statute to support the essential services of the Police and Fire during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. All board members and City staff are asked to please identify themselves and be recognized by the Chair, so we make certain speakers are clearly identified for the minutes of this meeting.”

Chair McGill asked Vice Chair Hatch to conduct the remainder of the meeting as he was experiencing technical difficulties.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously with an abstention by Ms. Hatch to approve the minutes of November 4, 2020 as submitted.

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES:

Leland Edward Asbury	Jamie Douglas Cliff
Jammie Phillip Habenicht	Corey Quinte’ Howell Jr.
Ahmed Ibrahim	Eric Thomas Lansinger
Jaymie Marie Reaves	Travis James Rheinheimer
Roni Manuel Rodrigues	

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

The demographics of this class is five white males, one white female, one other male, one Hispanic male, and one black male.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS:

December 1, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Promotion to Firefighter Engineer:

Bradley Overcash

Promotion to Fire Captain:

Richard Binger	Zachry Bowman	Jason Cook
James Grigston	Philip Turpin III	Robert Whisnant

Promotion to Battalion Fire Chief:

Douglas de Jonge	Michael Gerin	Lance Patterson
Matthew Yost		

Promotion to Division Fire Chief:

David Farnum Jr.

Promotion to Deputy Fire Chief:

Peter Skeris

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion.

Deputy Chief Winkles stated that the demographics for the promotions is two black males with the rest being white males.

Ms. Reynolds asked that demographics of those being tested be presented. Deputy Chief Winkles stated that he will work on generating those statistics for past graduating classes as well as those demographics at the start of those classes moving forward.

NEW TESTING VENDOR FOR ENTRY-LEVEL FIREFIGHTER'S PROCESS:

Mark Tawney gave a presentation on behalf of the vender, Industrial/Organizational Solutions, and their proposal for a new testing process for entry-level firefighters. He is one of the owners of the company.

The presentation started with an overview of the selection system, including establishing validation evidence, basic skill assessment, and examining psychometric properties. Example of psychometric properties include cognitive ability measures such as reading/writing skills, logic and reasoning skills, spatial ability, and mathematical reasoning. Also included are non-cognitive measures such as personality, biodata, and integrity. Altogether, these elements constitute components of the "Firefighter Selection Tool" which comprises a 200-question test that is around two and half hours long. The purpose

December 1, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

of this tool is to ensure that individuals with different abilities make it to all section types and have a lower adverse impact against minority groups.

The presentation continued with an overview of diversity and impact considerations. This includes a job analysis that matches the diversity of the population of Charlotte in gathering opinions across a diversity of groups. The written exam has been developed to mitigate impact and monitored for any undue bias in questions.

Mr. Tawney went on to describe the administration timeline of the examination and analysis process. This included a discussion of COVID-19 precautions. He then asked for questions.

Ms. Reynolds asked if the assessors were external to the Charlotte Fire Department. Mr. Tawney replied that graduate students in psychology in the Chicago area will be utilized in the SOI evaluation.

Ms. Reynolds followed up with a question about the experts in the SME group; Mr. Tawney replied that Charlotte Firefighters will be used for that piece. Chair McGill asked which Firefighters will be selected and Mr. Tawney responded that they are still being evaluated but will choose five to ten participants that are reflective of the diversity of the City and ranks within the department. Those chosen participants will be made to sign confidentially agreements. Deputy Chief Winkles described the input that CFD has been giving in the selection process.

Hearing no further discussion, Vice Chair Hatch entertained a motion by the board to approve the process for the CFD.

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the testing process as presented for entry level firefighters.

OTHER BUSINESS

Chief Johnson addressed the board to congratulate Deputy Chief Bonham for retiring after twenty-eight years of service. He also took the opportunity to thank Deputy Chief Winkles, whose been intimately involved with the Civil Service Board, for his promotion to Chief Bonham's former position and to introduce Pete Skeris who will be filling Deputy Chief Winkles' role with the board.

Update on Hearings

Clerk Kelly gave an update on the hearing schedule and those dates which are still tentative. This included a reminder about the November 19th hearing which was rescheduled to December 4th. The hearing will be held at the Solid Waste Services Building, located at 1105 Otts Street, starting at 8:30 a.m. COVID-19 precautions, such as social-distancing, temperature checks, and mask requirements, will be present as well as boxed lunches and snacks.

Clerk Kelly then stated that the hearing on December 16th and 17th is looking at being conducted at the Police Training Academy. She also reminded the Board about the fourth Wednesday of the month being held for Board hearings.

Clerk Kelly concluded by noting that Rule IX is being discussed by City Council and the board will be updated following that meeting.

December 1, 2020

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no further discussion, Vice Chair Hatch asked for a motion to adjourn.

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to adjourn.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:49 P.M.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board



Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board

January 5, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met by electronic platform on Tuesday, January 5, 2021 at 3:30 P.M. with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members attending remotely were: Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, David McCleary, Ryan McGill, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, and Ryon Smalls.

ABSENT: Doug Young

ALSO PRESENT: Patrick Baker, City Attorney; Lina James, Deputy City Attorney; Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board; Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board; and Jill Sanchez-Myers, Board Attorney

CALL TO ORDER:

Chair McGill called the meeting to order at 3:32 PM and read the following statement: "Today's Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted virtually in accordance with the electronic meeting statute to support the essential services of the Police and Fire during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. All board members and City staff are asked to please identify themselves and be recognized by the Chair, so we make certain speakers are clearly identified for the minutes of this meeting."

Chair McGill introduced the city and board attorneys present and asked the visiting representatives from the Parker Poe law firm, Mac McCarley and Anthony Fox, to introduce themselves to the board. Shelia Simpson, HR representative for the Charlotte Fire Department, was introduced along with the rest of the Civil Service Board.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.
--

APPROVE MINUTES:

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of December 1, 2020 as submitted.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS:

Promotion to Fire Captain:

Caston Brown-Butler	Brian Cunningham
---------------------	------------------

Promotion to Battalion Fire Chief:

Jonah Smith

Promotion to Division Fire Chief:

January 5, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Phillip Bosche Jr.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Ms. Reynolds, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to NC General Statute 143-318.11(a)(6) to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of prospective CFD promotions.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 3:40 P.M. BY PAUSING THE REGULAR MEETING AND JOINING ANOTHER ELECTRONIC INVITATION. THE ATTENDANCE OF THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK, AND CFD REPRESENTATIVES WAS CONFIRMED.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 3:48 P.M.

THE BOARD, BOARD ATTORNEY, AND BOARD CLERK REJOINED THE MEETING TO CONTINUE WITH THE REMAINING PORTION OF THE MEETING IN OPEN SESSION.

Motion was made by Ms. Hatch, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion.

Chair McGill offered condolences on behalf of the board to CFD for the recent passing of Fire Engineer Patric Saunders.

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES:

Jacob Michael Ambos	Juwan Olandis Brown
Mario Valentino Ciccone	Daniel Paul Doerflinger
John Shawn Hasiotis	Luke Aiden Landsem
William Edward Mills	Christopher Andrew Smith
Seth Edward Stephens	Charles Timothy Thompson Jr.
Eric Charles Viekant	

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

The demographics of this class is eight white males, two black males, and one Asian male.

UPDATE ON RULE IX:

City Attorney Patrick Baker, along with Parker Poe attorneys Mac Carley and Anthony Fox, spoke to the board concerning personnel procedures as they relate to Rule IX and the CMPD and CFD. They began with an overview of how, within the State of North Carolina, rules and procedures as they pertain to HR differ between municipalities, particularly as it relates to those municipalities which have Civil Service Boards. In the case of the City of Charlotte, the City Charter states that promotions are made within the full authority of the CFD and CMPD subject only to the stipulation that those promotions must be

January 5, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

approved by the Civil Service Board, be based upon merit, and comply with state and federal regulations. Due to this, despite Rule IX being adopted by City Council, that rule cannot be adopted due to its inconsistency with the City Charter.

Ms. Reynolds asked for clarification that, with the understanding that Rule IX is not legally enforceable, the Chiefs of CMPD and CFD are able to make promotions fully based on their authority granted by the City Charter. Mr. McCarley confirmed that it is the legal opinion of Parker Poe that the City Charter overrules any provisions put forth by Rule IX or any other City Council or administrative adopted policy other than those adopted by the Chief of CMPD or CFD.

Chair McGill asked for further explanation of the City Charter. Mr. McCarley explained that each city and town in North Carolina has a charter that is passed by the State Legislature that lays out the basic framework for each municipality that dictates its governance and functions as a matter of state law, including in this particular case, the promotional procedures being discussed. Mr. McCleary asked if changing this Charter requires legislative action, of which Mr. McCarley confirmed and recommended due to recent developments in HR best practices.

Chair McGill asked if Chief Johnson or Deputy Chief Winkles had any thoughts regarding their promotional process if Rule IX is no longer applicable. Chief Johnson replied that they have created a draft policy in conjunction with HR representative Simpson, local unions, and other members of the department not represented by aforementioned groups. Further, he referenced the interaction they have had with CSB in formulating the promotional process and, due to these factors, feels confident in implementing that promotional policy.

Ms. Reynolds asked that if Rule IX is no longer applicable, who will approve the promotional process. Mr. McCarley clarified that, while the final promotion is subject to the approval of the CSB, the process itself is determined by the heads of those departments. Chief Johnson interjected to state the safeguards and regulatory oversight implemented within the promotional process.

Mr. Smalls and Mr. McCleary asked for clarification about the appeal process in promotions. Mr. McCarley confirmed that the Civil Service Board retains the power to request an investigation in the public interest. Ms. Simpson stated that the promotional process embraces equitability, written assessment, and fair access to assessment training materials. Oral interviews and situational analysis are also tested. Ms. Simpson asserted that both departments conduct the process in compliance with Title XI and discrimination laws, with Mr. McCarley and Mr. Fox concurring with that assertion.

OTHER BUSINESS

Chief Skeris shared that 1164 candidates applied in the recently closed entry-level application process. Of this, 56% are white males with the remaining being minority - of which 7% are female. For the promotions approved at this CSB meeting, two are white males and two are black males.

Update on Hearings

Assistant Clerk McSwain explained the COVID-19 circumstances which lead to the postponement of the previously scheduled December hearings. An overview of confirmed attendance at upcoming hearings was discussed, with members of the board volunteering for those hearings which required additional members to be held.

January 5, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Annual Report

Ms. Millen asked that the annual report be amended to include the vote count on the SAFE Coalition recommendation. Additionally, Mr. McGill asked for a motion to expand the size of the board.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Ms. Hatch, and carried unanimously to recommend to City Council to expand the board to eleven members.

Motion was made by Mr. Baldwin, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to adopt the Civil Service Board annual report as amended.

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no further discussion, Chair McGill asked for a motion to adjourn.

Motion was made by Mr. Smalls, seconded by Ms. Hatch, and carried unanimously to adjourn.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:41 P.M.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board



Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board

February 2, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met by electronic platform on Tuesday, February 2, 2021 at 4:00 P.M. with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members attending remotely were: Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, David McCleary, Ryan McGill, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Ryon Smalls, and Doug Young.

ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Lina James, Deputy City Attorney; Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board; Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board; and Jill Sanchez-Myers, Board Attorney

CALL TO ORDER:

Chair McGill called the meeting to order at 4:01 PM and read the following statement: “Today’s Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted virtually in accordance to the electronic meetings statute to support the essential services of the Police and Fire departments during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. All board members and City staff that wish to speak are asked to please be recognized by the Chairperson, so we make certain speakers are clearly identified and heard.”

APPROVE AGENDA:

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Several members mentioned that, due to technical difficulties in the distribution process, they did not receive meeting materials in advance of the meeting. As a result, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, and Ryon Smalls indicated their desire to abstain from votes related to these materials.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried with a vote of six members and three abstentions to approve the minutes of January 5, 2021 as submitted.

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES:

Emma Charlotte Bellamy	Shannon Lee Bowman	Madison Marie Brouckaert
Brendan Crossley Calvert	Aiden LeRay Caruana	Tristan Andrew Cheviron
Justin Melvin Crawley	Jaxon Hugh Cummings	Chad Coley Cunningham
Ronal Destine	Gregory Daniel Gerber	Michael John Giglio
Malik Shamel Harris	Paul Stephen Jablonski	Standrick Shamar Johnson
Edward Adam Kaminski	Raymond Knickerbocker Jr	Matthew Kieran Lutley
Iinul Fahmi Mohd Al Johari	Jorden James Montreuil	Manuel Alberto Romero-Penalosa
Billyjoe Cody Rogers	Alik Matthew Schrader	Nathan David Shomette

February 2, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Johnathan Wilson Stacy	Bethany Rose Stelzl	William Charles Uptegraff
Willy Davis Ynfante-Parra		

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried with a vote of six members and three abstentions to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

The demographics of this class is seventeen white males, four white females, three black males, three Hispanic males, and one other male.

In terms of demographics, Chair McGill remarked on his pleasure in reading the first three applicants names as they were female. CMPD announced the demographics of the upcoming 188 class as twenty-two white males, six black males, three Hispanic males, two Asian males, two other males, and five white females –a 35% minority representation rate.

CONSIDER CFD NEW HIRES:

Andrew Gonzalez	Austin Creagh	Brandon Hedrick
Chance Grey	Christopher Jones	Colin Ballew
Devondre Johnson	Eder Ornelas	Edward Leopard
Jaden Camp	Jeremy McIver	Joel LoTurco
John Anttila	John Elliott	Mark Brown
Matthew Foster	Nicholas Gill	Nicholas Henkle
Zachariah Johnson	Zachary McIlroy	

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried with a vote of six members and three abstentions to approve the CFD candidates recommended for hire.

The demographics of this class is two black males, one Hispanic male, two other males, and fifteen white males.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS:

Promotion to Firefighter Engineer:

Joel Rangal

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried with a vote of six members and three abstentions to approve the CFD candidate recommended for promotion.

The demographics of this promotion was one Hispanic male.

February 2, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

OTHER BUSINESS

Update on Hearings

Assistant Clerk McSwain gave an overview of confirmed attendance at upcoming hearings and the board discussed volunteering for those hearings which required additional members to be held. There was brief discussion concerning potential and past COVID-19 complications in scheduling hearings. City Attorney James and Board Attorney Sanchez-Myers confirmed that the exemptions provided in the Governor's emergency order currently allow for hearings to be held.

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no further discussion, Chair McGill asked for a motion to adjourn.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to adjourn.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:31 P.M.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board



Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board

March 2, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met by electronic platform on Tuesday, March 2, 2021 at 4:00 P.M. with Vice-Chair Charlitta Hatch presiding. Board members attending remotely were: Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, David McCleary, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Ryon Smalls, and Doug Young.

ABSENT: Ryan McGill

ALSO PRESENT: Lina James, Deputy City Attorney; Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board; Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board; and Jill Sanchez-Myers, Board Attorney

CALL TO ORDER:

Vice-Chair Hatch called the meeting to order at 4:01 PM and read the following statement: “Today’s Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted virtually in accordance to the electronic meetings statute to support the essential services of the Police and Fire departments during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. All board members and City staff that wish to speak are asked to please be recognized by the Chairperson, so we make certain speakers are clearly identified and heard.”

APPROVE AGENDA:

Motion was made by Mr. Young, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of February 2, 2021 as submitted.

Kamella Emmanuel introduced Tammy Phippen as the new manager at CMPD Human Resources. The board introduced themselves to Ms. Phippen.

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTIONS:

Promotion to the Rank of Major:

Police Captain Alexander Watson

Promotion to the Rank of Captain:

Police Lieutenant Robert Childs

Promotion to the Rank of Lieutenant:

Police Sergeant Michael Barrett-Carter

Police Sergeant Amy Baswell

Promotion to the Rank of Sergeant

March 2, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Police Officer Sandra Horton	Police Officer Mark Parrott
Police Officer Joseph Smith	Police Officer Jeffrey Williams

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS:

Promotion to Firefighter Engineer:

Chad Celetti

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate recommended for promotion.

OTHER BUSINESS

Update on Hearings

Assistant Clerk McSwain gave an overview of confirmed attendance at upcoming hearings and the board discussed volunteering for those hearings which required additional members to be held. There was brief discussion regarding the hearing which was cancelled due to a conflict with the appellant's attorney.

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no further discussion, Vice-Chair Hatch asked for a motion to adjourn.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to adjourn.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:18 P.M.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board



Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board

April 6, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met by electronic platform on Tuesday, April 6, 2021 at 4:00 P.M. with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members attending remotely were: Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, Ryan McGill, Carolyn Millen, Ryon Smalls, and Doug Young.

ABSENT: David McCleary and Chris Reynolds

ALSO PRESENT: Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board; Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board; Jill Sanchez-Myers, Board Attorney; and Stephanie Bello, Deputy City Clerk

CALL TO ORDER:

Chair McGill called the meeting to order at 4:01 PM and read the following statement: "Today's Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted virtually in accordance to the electronic meetings statute to support the essential services of the Police and Fire departments during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. All board members and City staff that wish to speak are asked to please be recognized by the Chairperson, so we make certain speakers are clearly identified and heard."

APPROVE AGENDA:

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Ms. Hatch and carried unanimously, with Chair McGill abstaining, to approve the minutes of March 2, 2021 as submitted.

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES:

John Patrick Brooks was removed from consideration at the request of CMPD.

Ruben NMN Cardenas	Gregory John Crittendon Jr	Michael Charles Gainey
Matthew Vincent Hallum	Kewone Dwayne Harris	Justin Donato Hodgin
Keshon Darius Jones	Rick Thomas McCord	Christopher Wayne Ryan
Donald Wesley Stephens	Davis Michael Stephenson	Ryan Miguel Stevens
Briar Andrew Louis Van Brunt	Sabrina Paige Wright	

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

The demographics of the new hires were eight white males, four black males, one Hispanic males, and one white female.

April 6, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Chair McGill asked Sergeant Foggie whether or not the CMPD discusses the importance of diversity in a large city with transfer candidates from smaller towns. Sergeant Foggie confirmed and noted the excitement that these candidates often have when considering transferring to a larger city. Vice-Chair Hatch asked about the inverse situation, candidates coming from an even larger city to the City of Charlotte, and Sergeant Foggie confirmed that similar conversations about expectations are held with such candidates.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS:

Promotion to Firefighter Engineer:

Colton Edwards

Promotion to Fire Captain:

Donald Howie	Richard Maschi
--------------	----------------

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate recommended for promotion.

CFD ANNOUNCEMENTS REGARDING FIREFIGHTER II ASSESSMENTS

The Charlotte Fire Department shared that, moving forward, the Firefighter II assessments will be “nearly identical” as the process in the past. Deputy Chief Skeris mentioned that everything they are tested on is learned in recruit school and that practical skills are the emphasis in the assessment. There are no automatic failures in skills testing.

OTHER BUSINESS

Update on Hearings

Assistant Clerk McSwain gave an overview of confirmed attendance at upcoming hearings and the board discussed volunteering for those hearings which required additional members to be held. There was brief discussion regarding the ability to vote in hearings virtually in the event that a panel member needed to leave early – the consensus was that it is preferable that all votes be recorded in person but that the topic could be further researched.

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no further discussion, Chair McGill asked for a motion to adjourn.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to adjourn.

April 6, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:31 P.M.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board



Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board

May 4, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met by electronic platform on Tuesday, May 4, 2021 at 4:00 P.M. with Vice-Chair Charlitta Hatch presiding. Board members attending remotely were: Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, David McCleary, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Ryon Smalls, and Doug Young.

ABSENT: Ryan McGill

ALSO PRESENT: Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board; Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board; and Jill Sanchez-Myers, Board Attorney

CALL TO ORDER:

Vice-Chair Hatch called the meeting to order at 4:01 PM and read the following statement: “Today’s Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted virtually in accordance to the electronic meetings statute to support the essential services of the Police and Fire departments during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. All board members and City staff that wish to speak are asked to please be recognized by the Chairperson, so we make certain speakers are clearly identified and heard.”

Clerk Kelly administered the Oath of Office to three board members that were recently reappointed: Charlitta Hatch, David McCleary, and Ryon Smalls.

APPROVE AGENDA:

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Smalls and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of April 6, 2021 as submitted.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS:

Promotion to Firefighter Engineer:

Geary Duckworth

Promotion to Fire Captain:

Matthew Carow

Jason Klemowicz

May 4, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion.

CONSIDER CFD NEW HIRES:

Zachary Branner	Brett Braswell	Mason Dixon
Clinton Freshwater	Christian Garcia	Gary Gibson
Austin King	Hunter LeBlanc	Christopher McMillian
Austin Moore	Jason Morris	Coleby Phillips
Armando Saldana	Jarrod Shumaker	Jacob Spooner
Jackson Steward	Carlo Thomas	James Upchurch
Ethan Winkler		

Motion was made by Ms. Clements, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for hire.

The demographics of the new hires were four black males and two Hispanic males. The Chief also thanked the Board for their participation in last month's hearing.

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTIONS:

Promotion to the Rank of Sergeant:

Police Officer William Buie	Police Officer Michael Frazer
Police Officer Bradley Potter	Police Officer Charlissa Reiber
Police Officer Shaun Ward	

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for promotion.

Tammy Phippen sent in an email following the meeting to the board regarding the demographics of the CMPD promotions: two white males, two black males, and one white females.

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES:

Alonzo Charles Franklin	Jose Luis Nieves Garcia	Kyndall George Jackson
Austin Matthew Kaufman	Collin Dean Miller	John William Morrissey Jr
Joseph David Moye	Malek Ziad Abder-Razzaq Odeh	Thomas Patrick O'Hare Jr
Trent Michael Smith	Kalmon Laroy Stokes	Derrick Leroy West

Motion was made by Mr. Clements, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to NC General Statute 143-318.11(a)(6) to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of prospective CMPD new hires.

May 4, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:16 P.M. BY PAUSING THE REGULAR MEETING AND JOINING ANOTHER ELECTRONIC INVITATION. THE ATTENDANCE OF THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK, AND CMPD REPRESENTATIVES WAS CONFIRMED.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:27 P.M.

THE BOARD, BOARD ATTORNEY, AND BOARD CLERK REJOINED THE MEETING TO CONTINUE WITH THE REMAINING PORTION OF THE MEETING IN OPEN SESSION.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously, with an abstention by Ryon Smalls, to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

The demographics of the new hires were four black males, six white males, and two Hispanic males.

OTHER BUSINESS

Update on Hearings

Assistant Clerk McSwain gave an overview of confirmed attendance at upcoming hearings and the board discussed volunteering for those hearings which required additional members to be held.

New Business

Mr. Clements discussed his concerns regarding the candidate application packets and whether or not the Board is receiving a “complete picture” or a “best picture” of the candidate from CMPD. Mr. McCleary concurred with Mr. Clements that it was the latter. Mr. Clements suggested that perhaps gaining access to the interviews with the candidates themselves might aide in evaluating candidate. Clerk Kelly clarified that what the Board receives per candidate is the same as what is submitted to the State. Further, she suggested that further conversation with CMPD and City Attorneys could be had regarding what the board can legally access and what might help in the evaluation process.

Mr. Clements also asked that the Board be given the applicant information further in advance so that the board has more time to thoroughly evaluate the candidates. Mr. Smalls echoed this sentiment. Clerk Kelly stated that she will request that the information be provided several days earlier in order to fulfill that request.

Ms. Millen asked if the previous hearing was limited to one day as a requirement of the Rules of Procedure and asked generally if this time limitation is incentivizing appeals or is exposing the board to scrutiny. Board Attorney Sanchez-Myers stated that the Rules of Procedures provides that the Chair of the hearing controls the presentation of evidence and asked that he speak to his decision in the latest case. Mr. McCleary replied that the Statement of Parties as well as the evidence presented in advance gave no reason for the hearing to require more than a day and that the other hearing members, Mr. Smalls and Mr. Young, concurred that it should only be a one-day hearing. Further, Mr. McCleary stated that this limitation was in line with similar cases in the past and that, along with the case-law, supports that it was a reasonable

May 4, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

limitation. Finally, Mr. Young noted that both parties during the hearing had agreed in advance to a one-day hearing.

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no further discussion, Vice-Chair Hatch asked for a motion to adjourn.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to adjourn.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:53 P.M.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board



Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board

June 1, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

The Civil Service Board (CSB) met by electronic platform on Tuesday, June 1, 2021 at 4:00 P.M. with Chair Ryan McGill presiding. Board members attending remotely were: Tom Baldwin, Kyle Clements, Charlitta Hatch, David McCleary, Ryan McGill, Carolyn Millen, Chris Reynolds, Ryon Smalls, and Doug Young.

ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Stephanie Kelly, Clerk to the Board; Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board; and Jill Sanchez-Myers, Board Attorney

CALL TO ORDER:

Chair McGill called the meeting to order at 4:01 PM and read the following statement: “Today’s Civil Service Board meeting is being conducted virtually in accordance to the electronic meetings statute to support the essential services of the Police and Fire departments during the COVID-19 pandemic. This matter has been properly noticed and all matters for consideration are properly before this Board. All board members and City staff that wish to speak are asked to please be recognized by the Chairperson, so we make certain speakers are clearly identified and heard.”

APPROVE AGENDA:

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda.

APPROVE MINUTES:

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Ms. Hatch and carried unanimously to approve the minutes of May 4, 2021 as submitted.

CONSIDER CFD PROMOTIONS:

Promotion to Firefighter Engineer:

Yomai Martinez

Motion was made by Mr. Millen, seconded by Mr. Baldwin, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate recommended for promotion.

Promotion to Fire Captain:

Adrian Cornette

Omar Kasso

June 1, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidates recommended for promotion.

Promotion to Battalion Fire Chief:

Nathaniel Mackey

Motion was made by Mr. Millen, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve the CFD candidate recommended for promotion.

Chair McGill congratulated Chief Johnson and the Charlotte Fire Department for being ranked in the top 1% of all fire departments in the nation.

Chief Johnson asked the Board if it was necessary for the recently confirmed candidate, Nathaniel Mackey, to be brought back for consideration in the following month for the same promotion to align with the promotional timeline. Board Attorney Sanchez-Myers and Clerk Kelly agreed to look into the issue to verify what is procedurally appropriate.

Chief Johnson updated to the Board that 49 out of 58 passed the Firefighter II assessment and that 4.27 out of 5 reported positively about the fairness of the process.

CONSIDER CMPD PROMOTIONS:

Promotion to the Rank of Captain:

Lieutenant Brian Hofert

Promotion to the Rank of Sergeant:

Police Officer Erin Anderson	Police Officer Scheldon Connor
Police Officer Michael Summerlin	

Ms. Millen again requested that CMPD provide additional information, such as leadership classes, about candidates for promotion. Both Mr. Young and Ms. Reynolds concurred and remarked that they believed that the board had previously agreed to this requirement. Clerk Kelly explained that this was likely due to a change in CMPD human resources staff and that moving forward they will be informed of this requirement. Robert Lucas agreed that he would speak to the human resources manager and that she will confirm by email this request.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for promotion.

Robert Lucas stated that the demographics of this promotional class were two white males, one white female, and one black male.

June 1, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

CONSIDER CMPD NEW HIRES:

Bianca Beatrice Anguiano	Malcolm JeMiller Boyd	Jacob Samuel Crawford
Antonet Marie Davis	Tania Ariana Guillen	Phillisha Marie Haffenden
Christopher Matthew Moody	Damian Ostaszewski	Jose Ricardo Renderos
Bradley Robert Servies	Nathan Raymond Spann	Joseph Patrick Tierney

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Mr. Young, and carried unanimously to go into closed session, pursuant to NC General Statute 143-318.11(a)(6) to consider the qualifications, competence, and fitness of prospective CMPD new hires.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD ENTERED INTO CLOSED SESSION AT 4:27 P.M. BY PAUSING THE REGULAR MEETING AND JOINING ANOTHER ELECTRONIC INVITATION. THE ATTENDANCE OF THE BOARD, THE ATTORNEY, THE CLERK, AND CMPD REPRESENTATIVES WAS CONFIRMED.

THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION AT 4:33 P.M.

THE BOARD, BOARD ATTORNEY, AND BOARD CLERK REJOINED THE MEETING TO CONTINUE WITH THE REMAINING PORTION OF THE MEETING IN OPEN SESSION.

Motion was made by Mr. McCleary, seconded by Ms. Millen, and carried unanimously to approve the CMPD candidates recommended for hire.

Lieutenant Miller reported that the demographics of the new hires are six white males, two black females, two Hispanic females, one black male, and one Hispanic male.

OTHER BUSINESS

New Business

Clerk Kelly discussed the possibility of changing the date of the July meeting to July 13th in order to accommodate the July 4th holiday. She further discussed the option of a virtual attendance option for upcoming meetings as the board will be returning to in-person meetings in the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Government Center. Board Attorney Sanchez-Myers confirmed that the virtual option is contingent upon the exception made by the Governor's Emergency Order related to COVID-19. There was brief discussion concerning the attendance expectation of Board members.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. Clements, and carried unanimously to approve holding the next meeting on July 13th, 2021.

Update on Hearings

June 1, 2021

Minute Book (), Page No. ()

Civil Service Board

Assistant Clerk McSwain gave an overview of confirmed attendance at upcoming hearings and the board discussed volunteering for those hearings which required additional members to be held.

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing no further discussion, Chair McGill asked for a motion to adjourn.

Motion was made by Ms. Millen, seconded by Mr. McCleary, and carried unanimously to adjourn.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:49 P.M.



Stephanie C. Kelly, Clerk to the Board



Kirk McSwain, Assistant Clerk to the Board

**Notice of Final Decision of the City of Charlotte Civil Service Board Regarding Dismissal
of Officer as Disciplinary Action**

OFFICER: Officer Andrew Helms

DATE OF DECISION: March 24, 2021

TYPE OF ACTION: Dismissal

SPECIFIC ACTS OR OMISSIONS THAT WERE BASIS OF DISMISSAL:

- **Violation of Rule of Conduct #10G: Neglect of Duty.** Officer Helms admitted to violation of this Rule of Conduct.
- **Violation of Rule of Conduct #10G: Neglect of Duty.** Officer Helms admitted to violation of this Rule of Conduct.
- **Violation of Rule of Conduct #6B: Unbecoming Conduct.** Officer Helms failed to back his colleagues on calls for service on the incident dates, creating operational safety and confidence concerns for his colleagues and supervisors. This also impaired the efficiency of CMPD and its personnel.